Republic of the Philippines

SENATE

Pasay City

JOURNAL

SENATE SITTING AS AN
IMPEACHMENT COURT
ON THE IMPEACHMENT TRIAL OF
VICE-PRESIDENT
SARA ZIMMERMAN DUTERTE

IMPEACHMENT TRIAL NO. 15
TUESDAY, 11 AUGUST 2026

PREPARED BY THE
LEGISLATIVE JOURNAL SERVICE
SENATE OF THE PHILIPPINES

IMPEACHMENT TRIAL NO. 15
Tuesday, August 11, 2026

PROCLAMATION OF THE SERGEANT-AT-ARMS

The Sergeant-at Arms, PMGen Alfred S. Corpus, commanded all persons, on pain of penalty, to keep silent while the Senate is sitting for the trial of the Articles of Impeachment against Vice President Sara Zimmerman Duterte.

CALL TO ORDER

At 10:00 a.m., Tuesday, August 11, 2026, the Senate President, Win Gatchalian, with the Senate sitting as an Impeachment Court, called the impeachment trial of Vice President Sara Zimmerman Duterte to order.

PRAYER

Senator-Judge Vicente C. Sotto III led the prayer, to wit:

Almighty and merciful God, we come before You with humility as our nation enters a solemn and consequential moment in the impeachment proceedings.

We pray that You guide every person entrusted with this constitutional process, especially each senator who will sit as a judge. Grant us who are gathered in this august Chamber integrity, good faith, courage, and sound judgment.

Keep our hearts free from political pressure, personal interests, prejudice, anger, and fear. May we seek not what is convenient or popular but what is right, just, and faithful to the truth.

Dear Lord, Father God, remind each of us that our duty is not to any individual, party, or faction. Our duty is to You, to the Filipino people, and to the Constitution.

Give us the wisdom to weigh the evidence carefully, the fairness to listen with an open mind, and the courage to make decisions according to our conscience and the law.

May truth prevail over rumor, facts over speculation, and justice over politics. Let every proceeding be conducted with dignity, fairness, and respect for the rule of law.

Dear Lord, protect our country from division and hatred. Give our people patience, discernment, and faith in the proper institutions of our republic.

May Your wisdom guide us, may Your justice lead us, and may Your truth prevail.

Amen.

ROLL CALL

Upon direction of the Senate President, the Clerk of Court, Atty. Renato N. Bantug Jr., called the roll, to which the following senator-judges responded:

Aquino, B.	Padilla, R.
Cayetano, P. S.	Pangilinan, F. N.
Ejercito, J. V.	Sotto III, V. C.
Escudero, F. G.	Tulfo, E. T.
Gatchalian, W. T.	Tulfo, R. T.
Hontiveros, R.	Villanueva, J.
Lacson, P. M.	Villar, C. A.
Lapid, M. M.	Villar, M. A.
Marcos, I. R.	Zubiri, J. M. F.

With 18 senator-judges present, the Chair declared the presence of a quorum.

Senator-Judge Go was also present.

Senator-Judges Estrada and Marcoleta were under detention and unable to attend.

Senator-Judges Cayetano (A), Dela Rosa, and Legarda were absent.

In accordance with the *Rules of Procedure on Impeachment Trials*, Senate President Gatchalian recognized the duly elected Presiding Officer, Senator-Judge Francis "Chiz" G. Escudero, to preside over the proceedings of the Impeachment Court.

APPROVAL OF THE *JOURNAL*

Upon motion of the Presiding Officer, there being no objection, the Body dispensed with the reading of *Journal* No. 14 of the Senate sitting as an Impeachment Court on August 5, 2026 and considered the same as approved.

CALLING OF THE CASE

Upon direction of the Presiding Officer, the Clerk of Court called Case No. 004-2026, entitled *"In the Matter of the Impeachment Trial of Vice President Sara Zimmerman Duterte."*

APPEARANCES

The Presiding Officer directed the parties to enter their appearances.

Rep. Joel Chua entered the appearances previously entered on behalf of the Panel of Prosecutors.

Atty. Kristine Ferrer entered the same appearances on behalf of the Respondent.

Representative Chua requested that Atty. Lorna P. Kapunan be recognized for the continuation of direct examination of witness.

MANIFESTATION OF ATTORNEY KAPUNAN

Attorney Kapunan recalled that when the impeachment trial adjourned on August 5, 2026, the

Prosecution had moved, and subsequently modified its motion, to allow the 4,492 documents to be presented before the Clerk for Court for purposes of comparison. She recalled that the Presiding Officer had directed the parties to make themselves available on Thursday and Friday of the previous week, and for the parties to mutually agree only on the time of the meeting. Notwithstanding the directive, however, she lamented that the Counsel for the Respondent failed to coordinate with the Prosecution despite repeated text messages from the latter on Wednesday and Thursday. She said that it was only at 5:38 p.m. on Thursday that the Counsel for Respondent informed the Prosecution that they would be available on August 14.

Attorney Kapunan argued that meeting on August 14 would no longer serve any purpose considering that the trial was already scheduled for August 10. She said that Counsel for the Respondent acted in bad faith for asserting that the Presiding Officer merely directed the parties to agree on a date and time of the meeting. She said that the Clerk of Court was also waiting over the weekend for notice about the meeting.

She further stated that, as a last attempt that morning, the Prosecution approached the Counsel for the Respondent and in the remaining hour before the trial, proposed to begin comparing the documents but was again declined, with the latter maintaining there was no need to conduct the comparison as the Prosecution could simply present summaries — consistent with the position of the Defense during pre-trial when the Respondent's counsel refused to stipulate to the documents on the ground that copies were not faithful reproductions.

Attorney Kapunan then stated that since the matter involved 4,492 documents, the Prosecution, as basis for presenting evidence, would proceed by briefly reviewing the documents and identifying the witness' summaries and tabulations, consistent with Rule 130, Sections 3(c) and 7 of the *Rules of Court*.

Asked by the Presiding Officer whether the Prosecution witness, Ms. Xylene Mae Del Campo, State Auditor of the Intelligence and Confidential Funds Audit Office (ICFAO), Commission on Audit (COA), had prepared tabulations or summaries of the acknowledgment receipts (ARs) covering the first to third quarters of 2023 for the Office of the Vice President (OVP) and Department of Education (DepEd), Attorney Kapunan replied in the affirmative. For the OVP, she stated that Ms. Del Campo had tabulations and summaries of acknowledgement receipts covering: 1st quarter (February 6 to March 29, 2023) - 519 ARs; 2nd quarter (April 25 to June 30, 2023) - 530 ARs; and 3rd quarter (July 14 to September 30, 2023) - 774 ARs, for a total 1,823 ARs. In addition, she said that Ms. Del Campo would confirm Attorney Wamil's tabulation covering December 21 to 31, 2022 consisting of 845 ARs, bringing the total OVP ARs to 2,668.

For the DepEd, she stated that Ms. Del Campo had tabulations covering: 1st quarter (February 20 to March 30, 2023) - 561 ARs; 2nd quarter (April 25 to June 30, 2023) - 619 ARs; and 3rd quarter (July 14 to September 30, 2023) - 644 ARs, or a total of 1,824 DepEd ARs.

Noting a total of 4,492 documents which the Counsel for the Respondent had declined to stipulate, Attorney Kapunan said that the Prosecution was constrained to present Ms. Del Campo and the corresponding tabulations before the Court.

The Presiding Officer affirmed that Ms. Del Campo could testify based on the tabulations in her possession, pursuant to Rule 130, Section 3(c), in relation to Section 7, as an exception to the original document rule.

Apart from the tabulations, Attorney Kapunan stated that the Prosecution would present folders containing the ARs, which would not be individually identified; instead, the witness would simply go through the folders and flip through the documents for purposes of presentation.

As regards any claim, she stressed that the Respondent had been given the opportunity to examine and compare the documents but declined to do so, citing either insufficient counsel or available time. She emphasized that Counsel for the Respondent would nonetheless have the opportunity to examine and compare the documents when formally offered in evidence.

The Presiding Officer noted Attorney Kapunan's manifestation.

MANIFESTATION OF ATTORNEY FERRER

Attorney Ferrer expressed appreciation for the Prosecution's willingness to proceed under Rule 130, Section 7, which she said would help expedite the proceedings. She explained that in her view, there was no need for the parties to compare the exhibits beforehand because their authenticity would ultimately be determined by the Court upon the Prosecution's formal offer of evidence, at which point, the Counsel for the Respondent counsel would be given an opportunity to comment and raise objections.

Attorney Ferrer also clarified that she had not stipulated as to the competency of Ms. Del Campo to identify the exhibits because she was not familiar with the witness and the extent of her examination of the documents, particularly since she merely took over the work previously prepared by Attorney Wamil.

Considering that Rule 130, Section 7 allows a witness to testify on the basis of a summary or tabulation, which may establish the witness's familiarity with and examination of the documents covered by the summary, Attorney Ferrer said this was the basis for suggesting that the Prosecution proceed through the witness' summaries and tabulations rather than individually identifying all the documents.

Attorney Ferrer said that the Respondent would not object to the number of documents the Prosecution would use as samples for identification, since the rule does not require the Respondent to stipulate to their authenticity before the rule may be invoked. She further said that based on experience, she estimated that the Prosecution could complete the identification of the documents for an entire quarter in less than 10 minutes. She added that Counsel for the Respondent would not object to the Prosecution's use of Rule 130, Section 7 or to the manner by which the Prosecution intended to present the documents, subject to the right of the Counsel for the Respondent to cross-examine the witness.

RULING OF THE PRESIDING OFFICER

The Presiding Officer clarified that a ruling was indeed made for the parties to try and meet on Thursday or Friday but the same did not push through either due to unavailability of Counsel for the Respondent or to inclement weather. In lieu of a meeting, he directed Counsel for the Respondent to submit copies of its marked exhibits within the day or, at the latest, the following day, so the Court itself could compare them with the Prosecution's pre-marked exhibits. Attorney Ferrer undertook to comply with the directive.

As to the witness, Ms. Xylene Mae Del Campo, the Presiding Officer noted Counsel for the Respondent's manifestation that it would not object to the presentation of a table and/or summary pursuant to Rule 130, Section 7, in relation to Section 3(c).

For her part, Attorney Kapunan manifested that the summary would only establish that the documents submitted by the Defense to the COA were the same documents used by the COA in issuing the AOMs, notices of suspension, and notices of disallowance. She however expressed concern that when subsequent witnesses testify on specific acknowledgment receipts, Counsel for

the Respondent might object on the ground that these had not been identified. She thus sought a stipulation that the Defense would not object to the presentation of specific acknowledgment receipts through subsequent witnesses.

The Presiding Officer clarified that the witnesses would, in any event, be subject to cross-examination, during which Counsel for the Defense may raise any discrepancies between the parties' copies. By then, the Court, would already have both sets of documents and could make the appropriate ruling.

Attorney Kapunan further manifested that the Prosecution was amenable to using the Defense exhibits, thereby obviating the need for comparison. The Presiding Officer however explained that the Court had yet to receive copies of the Defense exhibits, and that obtaining them would best facilitate the process. Once received, copies would be furnished to the Prosecution for use at the appropriate time.

Attorney Ferrer clarified that the use of the Defense exhibits would not dispense with the need to establish the competence of the Prosecution's witnesses to identify the documents, absent which, the exhibits would be rendered useless.

PRESENTATION OF WITNESS

Attorney Kapunan called Ms. Del Campo to the witness stand. The Presiding Officer reminded the witness that she remained under the same oath administered during the previous trial proceedings on Wednesday, August 5, 2026.

The Presiding Officer also stated that there was no need for the witness to go through the individual ARs to establish that she prepared her table and/or summary based on the 4,492 ARs, as this was already understood by the Court. He clarified that the witness only needed to refer to a particular AR if the Prosecution would request its identification.

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF THE WITNESS
(*Continuation*)

Attorney Kapunan continued the direct examination of the witness, as follows:

Ms. Kapunan. With the permission of this Honorable Court, good morning. Good morning to the Presiding Officer, to the Impeachment Judges, and good morning, Counsel for the Respondent.

Good morning, Madam Witness. Would you like to come closer to the mic? *Parang nagkukuwentuhan lang tayo, ano*? Be comfortable, okay?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Now, we will continue with your—where we broke off at the last hearing, when you were here and we had preliminary questions, *ano*? But I regret that I have to ask you again because just earlier, the Counsel for the Respondent is questioning your competence.

Madam Witness, can you remind us again, how long have you been with the COA?

Ms. Del Campo. I have been with COA for the past 11 years. Actually *po*, *magti*-twelve years *na po*.

Ms. Kapunan. As COA?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. And what was your educational background, Madam Witness? *Saan ka nag-aral*?

Ms. Del Campo. I earned *po* my bachelor's degree, Bachelor of Science in Accountancy, from Saint Louis University *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. *At pagkatapos mo nag*-graduate *sa* Saint Louis University, *saan ka nagtrabaho*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang una ko pong naging trabaho* is as junior auditor *sa isang* private firm *po sa* Baguio City.

Ms. Kapunan. And after that?

Ms. Del Campo. After two years *po*, *nag*-apply *na po ako sa* COA *at doon na po ako nag*-start *noong* August 26, 2014.

Ms. Kapunan. August 26?

Ms. Del Campo. 2014 *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And earlier, you said that you were in COA-ICFAO, correct?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. And what particular activity or duties did you have with this office?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang mga naging* duties *ko po sa* COA-ICFAO is, first, to conduct post-audit of the liquidation documents of various government agencies *sa* liquidation *po nila sa* intelligence and confidential fund, and draft *po* an Audit Observation Memorandum, Notice of Suspension, or Notice of Disallowance *po* as may be warranted under Rules and Regulations on Settlement of Accounts, and after *pong mag*-respond *ng* agency, *ako rin po ang nag-e*-evaluate *ng mga* Responses *po sa mga* AOM *at* Notice of Suspension.

Ms. Kapunan. So, based on your narration, 11 years *mo na ginagawa ito*? *Nag-i*-issue *ng* Audit Observation Memorandum, Notice of Suspension, Notice of Disallowance, *at pinag-aaralan din ang mga* Response *ng mga* national agencies *na* covered *ng* confidential and intelligence fund.

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Tell us, Madam Witness, how many of these national agencies, local government units, public officials have you conducted a post audit?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong sa* national government agencies *po,* more than 20 *na. Sa* local *po, madami-dami na rin po, mga* more than 50. *Sa* GOCCs *naman po, mga* less than 10, *mga* five to 10 *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. So more than 20 national agencies, *tama*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. More than 30, 50, local government units?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. And—?

Ms. Del Campo. *Mga* GOCCs *po, mga* less than 10.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. So when you took over, *noong ikaw ang nag*-take over *kay* Attorney Wamil, *noong* February when he retired or was transferred to another COA office in February 2024, you were then at that time also in COA-ICFAO.

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po. Tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And *ano naman ang* participation *mo,* if any, *dito sa pag*-post audit *ng* confidential funds *ng* Office of the Vice President *at ng* DepEd secretary?

Ms. Del Campo. *Sa* Office of the Vice President *po, ang naging* participation *ko po is doon sa*—for the period December 21 to 31, 2022, *ako po ang nag*-evaluate *ng* Response *nila sa* Notice of Suspension. *Doon naman po sa* first to third quarters *ng* 2023, *ako po ang nag*-evaluate *sa* Response *nila sa mga* Audit Observation Memorandum. *Sa* DepEd *naman po, ako po ang nag*-evaluate *ng* Responses *nila para doon sa dalawang* AOM for the first to third quarters of 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Madam Witness, you took over the functions or you took over *iyong mga in*-audit *ni* Attorney Wamil. Are you aware *na gumawa siya ng isang* tabulation *tungkol sa* acknowledgment receipts for the last quarter of the Office of the Vice President, December 21 to 31? Are you aware *na mayroong ginawang* tabulation *si* Attorney Wamil?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po,* aware *po ako sa* tabulation *ni* Mr. Wamil.

Ms. Kapunan. If this tabulation is shown to you—and for purposes of identification, Your Honor, this has been previously marked in evidence as P-I-29 for the Prosecution. Showing to you, Madam Witness, please go over this tabulation prepared, and may we ask permission for attorney—our associate, Atty. Jay dela Cruz — to be allowed to present this to the witness?

The Presiding Officer. Assisting Counsel of the parties may approach.

Ms. Kapunan. For the record, Your Honor, the witness is going over the tabulation submitted and marked by Attorney Wamil, and it is Exhibit P-I-29.

The Presiding Officer. Noted and made part of the records.

Ms. Kapunan. Do you confirm, Madam Witness, that *ito ang* tabulation *na sinubmit* (submit) *ni* Attorney Wamil *sa* COA-ICFAO office *na minana mo sa kanya?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po. Ito po iyong* tabulation *na kasama po doon sa mga* documents *na na*-forward *sa akin.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. After you received these documents from Attorney Wamil, through the office of the COA-ICFAO, what happened next?

Ms. Del Campo. After *po ma*-issue *iyong* Notice of Suspension *sa* OVP, *nag*-submit *po sila ng* Response *noong* March 13, 2024 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Itong* Response *na sinasabi mo, mayroon ka bang kopya?* And if shown to you—if shown to you *itong* Response *ng* Office of the Vice President, will you be able to identify the same?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, for easy reference of the Presiding Officer and this Impeachment Court, may we ask permission to flash it on the screen, Your Honor?

The Presiding Officer. Counsel may do so.

You are referring to Exhibit P-I-13-b?

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. And Respondents' I-120-OVP?

Ms. Kapunan. This is a stipulated document, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. You may proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. So, the Counsel for the Defense is now looking at it.

Madam Witness, having gone over this document, Madam Witness, *ito ba iyong sinasabi mong* Letter Response *ng* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po. Ito po iyong* same copy *ng* Response *ng* OVP *sa* Notice of Suspension.

Ms. Kapunan. I will now show you the second page of this letter, Madam Witness, being flashed on the screen. Please look at the second page, in particular, we have what appears to be certain signatures, *mga* signature *na nandiyan sa* second page *ng* response *ng* Office of the Vice President. If shown to you, Madam Witness, would you be able to identify these signatures?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. There is a signature appearing on top of the name Attorney Zuleika—Attorney Lopez. There is a signature appearing above the name Atty. Zuleika Lopez. Would you be able to identify that signature?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit*, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasama po kasi doon sa isinubmit* (submit) *sa* liquidation documents *na naibigay sa akin at na*-turn over *sa akin iyong* list *ng signatories po ng* OVP.

Ms. Kapunan. *At kasama ba doon ang signature ni* Attorney Zuleika Lopez?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. There is another signature here appearing atop the name Lemuel Ortonio. Please go over this signature and tell us if you are familiar. *Nakikilala mo ba itong* signature *ng isang* Ortonio *sa dokumentong ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Why, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasama din po ito doon sa* list *ng* specimen signature *na na*-submit *sa amin doon sa* liquidation documents *nila*.

Ms. Kapunan. And *pag-alam mo, sino ba itong* Atty. Zuleika Lopez?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po dito sa dokumento na ito, siya po ang* chief of staff *ng* OVP—undersecretary *po at* chief of staff.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ito naman* Mr. Lemuel Ortonio, *sino naman itong* Lemuel Ortonio *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa* document, *siya po ang* assistant secretary and assistant chief of staff.

Ms. Kapunan. *Sa* Letter Response *na ito na na*-identify *mo, may nakalagay—mayroon bang naka*-attach *dito sa* letter response?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*, *nag*-attach *po sila ng* list of 105 activities *ng* Office of the Vice President for the period December 13 to 31, 2022.

Ms. Kapunan. First quarter *ng*—

Ms. Del Campo. Fourth quarter *po,* fourth quarter *ng* 2022, specifically December 13 to 31, 2022.

Ms. Kapunan. If we show you this list of activities *na in*-attach *sa* Letter Response, will you be able to identify this list?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. We are flashing on the screen, Your Honor, a list of activities, which is an attachment to the Letter Response of the OVP, Exhibit P-I-13-b, whereat *iyong listahan* allegedly *ng mga* activities *ng* OVP *ay naka*-enumerate.

Tell us, Madam Witness—Likewise, flashed on the screen, tell us Madam Witness, *ano ang* significance *nitong mga* list *ng* activities *na isinubmit ng* Office of the Vice President *sa kaniyang* Letter Response? *Anong ibig sabihin noon*, list of activities?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ay naging* attachment *nila* as documents evidencing success of information gathering and/or surveillance activities *po na* required *po kapag nagkakaroon ng* payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong* period covered *nitong* list of activities?

Ms. Del Campo. December 13 to 31, 2022 *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. And what—*Ang* observation *ay itong* activities *na nakalagay diyan ay* prior to the receipt of the Office of the Vice President of its confidential fund. *Ito ba ay kino*-confirm *mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po. Kasi iyong* cash advance *po* for 2022 *po* is for the period December 21 to 31, 2022.

Ms. Kapunan. *At kailan na tinanggap ang* cash advance?

Ms. Del Campo. December 21 *po ang* start.

Ms. Kapunan. *Hindi ba ang ibig sabihin ng* liquidation report *ay sinasabi mo kung ano iyong mga pinaggamitan mo ng* cash advance. *Tama ba iyon*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And, *sa palagay mo,* compliant *ba ito? Kasi* post-audit compliance *ito.*

Ms. Del Campo. Base *po sa* document *na ito, hindi po napakita dito na iyong* proof of success of the information gathering *at may mga* activities *din po dito na,* from December 13, 15, 17, 18, *na hindi po sakop doon sa* period of utilization *noong* cash advance, which is for December 21 to 31, 2022.

Ms. Kapunan. So, you mentioned a joint circular. *Mayroon ka bang—Ano—Anong pinagbasehan mo kung bakit* violation *ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. Under *po kasi sa* Joint Circular 2015-01, *kapag po ginamit ang* confidential fund *sa* payment of rewards, subject *po ito sa tatlong* conditions.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano iyong mga kondisyon na iyon*?

Ms. Del Campo. First *po,* it should be approved by the head of agency. *Pangalawa po,* it should be supported with documents evidencing success of the information gathering and/or surveillance activities on account of the information given by the informer. And *iyong* last *po* is, it should be directly related *sa* confidential activities *ng* agency *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. So, *ano diyan sa* requirements *ang sinasabi mong hindi sinunod ng* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po kasing listahan na ito, isinabmit* (submit) *nila as* proof of success of information-gathering to support the payment of rewards. *Pero* based *po sa* documents *na ito, hindi po namin nakita iyong* particular accomplishment.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Nakalagay sa dokumento,* examples *ng* activities *ng* Office of the Vice President for the confidential funds. *Pakibasa nga,* for the record, *kasi tama ba iyong basa namin may* tree planting, gift giving? Please read for the record, Madam Witness. *Ano iyong sinasabing pinaggamitan ng* confidential funds?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dito po sa* December 13, 2022, Department of Education 2022 Partners Appreciation Night in Mandaluyong City, Metro Manila. December 15, Knight—

Ms. Kapunan. *Sandali,* Appreciation Night?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Sa pagkakaintindi mo,* confidential activity *ba iyon, o nasa listahan ba*

iyan ...

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor—

Ms. Kapunan. ... *ng* confidential activities *based sa* joint circular?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po doon sa* enumeration *kung saan gagamitin ang* confidential fund, *hindi po ito nakasama doon.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Basahin mo pa iyong iba.* So, *hindi. Ano pa iyong iba*?

Ms. Del Campo. December 15, 2022, Knights of Rizal Supreme Council, 60th year of the Institute in Baguio City, Youth Campaign on Patriotism. *At mayroon din po noong—*

Ms. Kapunan. Compliant *ba ito sa listahan*?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa* joint circular, *hindi po ito nakasama doon sa mga* activities *po* under 4.8, *kung saan puwedeng gamitin ang* confidential fund.

Ms. Kapunan. *Basahin mo nga lahat ng* activities *na iyan,* for the *Record, at sabihin mo kung* compliant *ito, kung ito bang mga* activities *ay pinapayagan bilang* liquidation *ng* confidential funds.

Ms. Del Campo. *Mayroon po dito* December 17, 2022, Christmas activity in Happy Land, Tondo, Manila; Christmas activity and exploration meeting of Extension Office, Barangay 101 in Tondo, Manila; consultation with Barangay Chairmen ng Maynila in Manila; *Pasasalamat* and update meeting, TODA, in Barangay Batasan Hills, Quezon City. *May mga* activity *po dito na pasasalamat,* coordination meeting, *may mga* tree planting *po,* distribution of wheelchairs, gift-giving, medical mission, *at iba pong* activities *ng mga* satellite offices *po ng* Office of the Vice President.

Ms. Kapunan. *Sa* joint circular *na minensyon* (mention) *mo,* can you remind us, *ano ba talaga ang* definition *ng* confidential funds?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* confidential fund *po, ito po iyong* lumpsum amount *na nasa* General Appropriations Act, *na gagamitin po* for confidential activities *po ng isang ahensiya.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At itong binasa mo,* tree planting, Christmas— *napakadaming* Christmas party, *napakadaming* award ceremony, *iyan ba ay pinapayagan sa sinabi mong* definition *ng* confidential funds?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Hindi po.*

The Presiding Officer. With the indulgence of Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, please—

The Presiding Officer. With the indulgence of Counsel.

Ms. Xylene, *maliban sa hindi pinapayagan o pasok sa puwedeng paggastusan ng* confidential fund *iyong mga binasa po ninyo, iyong gastos ay ginawa rin bago na-*encash *iyong tseke?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Kung* based *po sa* document *na ito, mayroon po kasing* activities *dito na* from December 13 to 18 *na hindi po sakop doon sa* period of utilization, based *sa* accomplishment report.

The Presiding Officer. *Opo,* so *labas doon? Labas doon?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

The Presiding Officer. So, *hindi posibleng gamitin iyong perang na-*release *nang* 21 *para i-*reimburse *iyon, kung tama man iyong pinaggastusan?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po. Kasi* under the Joint Circular *po, mayroon pong* portion *doon na hindi po puwedeng gamitin* for reimbursement *iyong pondo ng* confidential.

The Presiding Officer. So, prospectively *lang. So, iyong mga* activities *na puwede lang ay* 21 to 31.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

The Presiding Officer. You may proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. *Dahil dito sa sinabi mong* violation, *wala sa* period *'no,* as observed *by* the Honorable Presiding Officer, *at dahil wala naman sa listahan sa* Joint Circular *kung saan puwedeng gamitin ang* confidential funds, *ano ang ginawa mo* after that, if any?

Ms. Del Campo. After *po* evaluating the response *ng* OVP *at saka po iyong mga* attachments *nito, ako po ay nag-*draft *ng* Notice of Disallowance *at isinabmit* (submit) *ko po ito sa aking* Division Chief for her review.

Ms. Kapunan. If I will show you–*'pag ipinakita sa iyo ang isang* Notice of Disallowance—for purposes of the record, Your Honor, this has been pre-marked as Exhibit P-I-13-c—would you be able to identify it?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Showing to you—Attorney Dela Cruz, will show it to you. Please go over this document and tell us if–the relationship of this document to the notice of disallowance you have mentioned. And, again, we are seeking permission to flash it for easy reference on screen.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, iyon po iyong* same copy *ng* Notice of Disallowance *na in*-issue *namin sa* Office of the Vice President.

Ms. Kapunan. Please look—Counsel. Please look at this Notice of Disallowance, there is a signature there on top of the name Nilda B. Plaras. *Kanino pong* signature *ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Si Assistant Commissioner Nilda Plaras po ang* Officer-in-Charge *ng* ICFAO *noong ma*-issue *po ang dokumento na ito.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong ibig sabihin 'pag pinirmahan ng isang* assistant commissioner *ang isang* Notice of Disallowance *na idrinap* (draft) *mo?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po* is for release *na po, na*-approve *po niya kung–ang laman nito, at* for release *na po ito sa* agency.

Ms. Kapunan. For release *ng* agency. Okay. Tell us, Madam Witness, *itong* Notice of Disallowance *ng* COA-ICFAO, *iyong* recommendation *mo, at iyong inaprub* (approve) *ng* Assistant Commissioner for release, *magkano–magkano ang* disallowed *ng* COA-ICFAO?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* disallowance *po is* 73,287,000.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano naman ang* basis *ng* disallowance *na ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* disallowance *po na ito, binubuo po ito ng,* first, *iyong* payment of rewards in the total amount of 69,787,000.

Ms. Kapunan. Before you proceed, Your Honors, please, this is being flashed on the screen. This is the first page of Exhibit P-I-13-c, which is the Notice of Disallowance identified by this witness.

First page *diyan*, Madam Witness, *ano ang* breakdown *o basehan ng iyong* Notice of Disallowance?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong* 73,287,000, *ang bumubuo po dito* is *iyong* payment for rewards amounting to P69,787,000 plus *iyong* P3.5 million for payments for tables and chairs, desktop computers, and printers *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Dalawa ang* amount *na naka*-indicate *diyan. Bakit dalawa ang* amount? *Paki*-explain.

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ba iyong sa* number one *na iyong* P69,587,000 *at iyong sa ...*

Ms. Kapunan. In No. 1, in item No.1, if you can check your document on the screen, item No. 1 *sa* Notice of Disallowance, *dalawa ang* amount *na naka*-state, *isa* P69,587,000 *at iyong isa ay* P69,787,000. *Ito ba ay* typo, discrepancy? *Ano ang—bakit may hindi pareho itong* amount?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ay isang* typographical error *po. Ang tamang* amount *po is* P69,787,000.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Ngayon naman* Madam Witness, let us go to Page 2, Item No. 2. *Ano naman–Pakibasa ang sinabi dito sa* Page 2, item No. 2.

Ms. Del Campo. The Notice of Disallowance *po* is issued *kasi iyong pangalawang* reason *po* is, "charging payment for tables and chairs, desktop computers, and printers in the total amount of P3.5 million to confidential fund without specifying that they were intended for the confidential operations/activities undertaken by the OVP, non-compliant with the requirement of Item 4.8.4 of the Joint Circular."

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano iyong* Item 4.8 *ng* circular *na sinasabi mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Puwede po ba akong mag*-refer *para po sa* Joint Circular? Your Honor, *puwede po ba—*

Ms. Kapunan. With the permission—

The Presiding Officer. Witness may refer to the document.

Ms. Del Campo. Thank you *po*.

Base *po sa* Item 4.8.4 *ng* Joint Circular, "purchase or rental of supplies, materials and equipment for confidential operations that cannot be done through regular procedures without compromising the information-gathering activity concerned."

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Bakit ito naging basehan ng* disallowance *noong* tables and chairs *na iyan? Hindi ba* confidential *iyon? Kung saan binili iyong* table and chair *na iyan? Hindi ba* confidential *iyon*, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po kasi nila ini*-specify *na* the payments for tables—*iyong* tables and chairs, and desktop computers were used for confidential operations *po. Wala po silang na*-submit *na* any explanation *doon sa* response *po nila.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Kailangan ba mag*-submit *ng—Ano ang mga kailangan i*-submit *na dokumento*—by way of—*para i*-explain *kung saan ginamit itong* tables and chairs, laptop, *at saka—Anong hinahanap ninyo sa* post-audit?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dapat po mapatunayan nila na ito ay binili para po sa* confidential operations *ng ahensiya.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At anong kailangan na dokumento*?

Ms. Del Campo. And since this pertains *po* as purchases, *dapat po* supported *ito ng* either sales invoice or official receipts *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Sa pag*-evaluate *mo nitong dokumentong sinabmit (submit) ng* Office of the Vice—*mayroon ba iyong mga* official receipts, sales invoice *na isinabmit*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Isa, dalawa, tatlo, walang sinabmi* (submit)*t*, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala pong mga resibo po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Now, based *sa iyong* audit, *sino-sino ang* liable persons *dito sa* connection, in connection—in connection with this Notice of Disallowance *na binasa mo? Sino-sino ang mga* persons *na* responsible or accountable *diyan sa ipinakita mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang mga* persons *po na* liable or responsible is, first *po,* the head of agency, Vice President Sara Duterte, the Special Disbursing Officer, *si* Ms. Gina Acosta, *at ang* Chief Accountant *po na si* Ms. Julietta Villadelrey.

Ms. Kapunan. *Sige. Sa* document *na iyan, puwede bang ipakita mo iyong mga pangalan na sinabi mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nasa* Page 2 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Showing to you Page 2, Madam Witness, and being flashed on the screen. Please tell us if these are the very same persons *na sinabi mo na* accountable.

Ms. Del Campo. *Yes po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit sila* accountable?

Ms. Del Campo. *Unang-una po iyong si* Vice President Sara Duterte *po, siya po ang nag*-approve *ng* transaction and including the utilization of the cash advance.

Ms. Kapunan. *Saan nakalagay diyan na siya ang nag*-approve?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon pong sa* Accomplishment Report. And then, *kay* Ms. Gina Acosta *naman po dahil siya ang* Special Disbursing Officer, and she disbursed *po* the cash advance.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ito namang Villadelrey, bakit sinasabi mo na* accountable officer *siya*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nag*-certify *po siya doon sa* box C *ng* Liquidation Report *na ang* supporting documents are complete and proper.

Ms. Kapunan. *Hindi ba nila ginawa ito, iyong mga sinasabi mo na kailangan sa* Joint Circular?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Yes?

Ms. Del Campo. *Eh kasi po iyong* participation *nila sa* transaction, *kaya po sila nasama sa* persons *na* liable *po sa* transaction *na ito dahil,* first, *si VP Sara bilang siya ang* head of agency *at siya po ang nag*-approve *ng* transaction and utilization *ng* cash advance. *Pangalawa po, ang naging* participation *po ni Ms. Gina Acosta* is *siya po ang* special disbursing officer *at siya po iyong nag*-disburse *ng* cash advance. *At kay Ms. Julieta Villadelrey naman po, sinertifay* (certify) *niya na* complete and proper *iyong* supporting documents *pero hindi po* complete and proper *iyong na*-submit *po sa amin.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Madam witness, *nag*-issue *ka—nag*-issue *ang* COA ICFAO *ng* Notice of Disallowance. What happened next, if any, *kung maalala mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Noon pong* February 5, 2025, *nag*-appeal *po ang* Office of the Vice President, *nag*-file *po sila ng* Petition for Review *sa* Commission Proper.

Ms. Kapunan. And do you know what happened to this Petition for Review?

Ms. Del Campo. *Noong* April 10, 2026 *po, naglabas ng* decision *ang* Commission Proper *at na*-furnish-*an po ang aming* office and *in*-affirm *po nila iyong* Notice of Disallowance in the total amount of P73,287,000.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *iyong* Petition for Review *ay* disallowed *pa rin?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Noon pong lumabas iyong desisyon ng* Commission Proper, *in*-affirm *po nila iyong* disallowance.

Ms. Kapunan. *Magkano iyong* disallowed *ng* Commission Proper?

Ms. Del Campo. Same *po sa nasa* Notice of Disallowance *namin,* ± 73,287,000 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At ano naman ang ibig sabihin ng* "disallowed"?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* notice of—*ang* disallowed *po* is *sa* level *ni* ICFAO *po kasi 'pag nag*-issue *kami ng* Notice of Disallowance, *mayroon na po silang*—we demand them *to—ibalik po iyong pondo. Pero mayroon pong* remedy, which is *iyong ginawa nila, nag-file sila ng* Petition for Review *po sa* Commission Proper.

Ms. Kapunan. *At ano naman ang nangyari sa* Petition for Review *na iyan*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon nga po, nagkaroon ng* COA decision *na in*-affirm *po nila iyong* Notice of Disallowance.

Ms. Kapunan. *Pagkatapos na in*-affirm *iyong* Notice of Disallowance *ng* Commission, *ano ang ginawa,* if at all?

Ms. Del Campo. *Noong* May *po*, May 2026, *mayroon po silang ifinayl* (file) *na* Motion for Reconsideration.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *nag*-file *ng* Motion for Reconsideration *ang* Office of the Vice President. *Anong nangyari sa* Motion for Reconsideration *na ifinayl* (file) *tungkol dito sa* decision *na ibalik ang* P73 million *na iyan? Ano ang* status?

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala pa pong naging* decision *ang* Commission Proper *po*. Pending resolution *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. *Punta naman tayo sa* first quarter and second quarter of 2023 which covers the Office of the Vice President's liquidation of confidential funds. What is your participation? *Ano naman ang* participation *mo dito sa pag*-evaluate *ng* liquidation expenses or documents *na isinabmit* (submit) *ng* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. For *anong* period *po*?

Ms. Kapunan. For the first and second quarters of 2023.

Ms. Del Campo. *Ako po ang nag*-evaluate *ng* response *ng* OVP *sa* Audit Observation Memorandum *po na na*-issue *sa kanila* for that period.

Ms. Kapunan. *Iyong dalawang* quarters *ay nag*-issue *ng* Audit Observation Memorandum. *Sino ang nag*-issue?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon po, si Mr. Wamil po. Na*-issue *po iyong* AOM *na iyon noong* time *ni Mr. Wamil.*

Ms. Kapunan. And if shown to you this AOM, Audit Observation Memorandum, dated February 2024—for the record, this is Exhibit P-I-13-e—being shown to the witness and being flashed on the screen for easy reference. Will you be able, Madam Witness, to identify the same?

For the record, this is a stipulated document.

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Pagkatapos ng* issuance *nitong* Audit Observation Memorandum, *mayroon bang ginawa ang* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nag*-submit *po sila ng* response *noong* April 19, 2024.

Ms. Kapunan. *Para saan itong* response?

Ms. Del Campo. Response *po nila sa* AOM *na na*-issue *po sa kanila* for the first and second quarters of 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. And just to remind us, *anong* period covered *ng* first quarter?

Ms. Del Campo. It's for February 6 to March 29, 2023, *at iyong* second quarter *po*, April 25 to June 30, 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. How many, Madam Witness, *kung maalala mo, ilang*—wait, I withdraw the question.

Ito ba sa response *na isinabmit* (submit) *ng* Office of the Vice President, *ano ang mga naka-*attach *dito sa* response *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Sa* response *po nila, nag*-attach *po sila ng* acknowledgment receipts, certification *ni* Colonel Lachica, *at mga* protective intelligence operations reports *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Before we go to those documents *na sinasabi mo*, sa response being shown on the screen, there is on the second page—Counsel, will you show the second page—there is a signature appearing on the second page of the response. Whose signature is that appearing above the name Attorney Lopez?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Kaninong* signature *iyan,* if you know?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kay Atty. Zuleika Lopez po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At dito naman,* above the name Mr. Ortonio?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kay Mr. Lemuel Ortonio po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And you are familiar with these signatures for the same reasons you stated earlier?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Sa* response *na isinabmit* (submit) *ng* Office of the Vice President, *sinabi mo kanina, mayroong mga* acknowledgment receipts. If shown to you a summary of these acknowledgment receipts—how many acknowledgment receipts were attached to the response for the first quarter of 2023?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong sa* first quarter *po ng* 2023 is 519.

Ms. Kapunan. Five hundred nineteen acknowledgment receipts. *At sinabi mo kanina,* this covers the period February 6 to March 29, 2023, *tama*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Sa* second quarter of 2023, *ilan naman ang* acknowledgment receipts *na isinabmit ng* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. Five hundred thirty *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. So, *pag* total number *ng* acknowledgment receipts for the first quarter and second quarter is how much?

Ms. Del Campo. One thousand forty-nine *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At*, Madam Witness, if shown to you these acknowledgment receipts or a summary—if shown to you certified true copies of these acknowledgment receipts, would you be able to identify the same?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. By agreement with the Honorable Presiding Officer, Your Honor, in lieu of this witness glossing over or looking over the documents, but they are in front of her, Your Honor, we manifest that she has prepared a tabulation.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, as agreed to also by Counsel for the Respondent, the witness need not peruse individually and flip over, as the word used by Counsel, these ARs and may refer to her tabulation and/or summary that she prepared with respect to Ma'am Xylene, the first and second quarter of 2022 for the ARs, acknowledgment receipts for the Office of the Vice President. You may refer to your table and/or summary, Ma'am, if you have one.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, please, may we also make the manifestation, Your Honor, for future witnesses, Your Honor, this should not—this should not dispense with our future witnesses being able to identify—to use and to identify certain acknowledgment receipts, Your Honor, which are part of the summary or tabulation.

The Presiding Officer. Without prejudice to the reservation of Counsel, the Court will allow it.

Ms. Xylene or Atty. Lorna, can you kindly give us a copy, because that is not yet a marked document, right?

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, for the record, we are handing over—

The Presiding Officer. That is not a pre-marked document; rather, the table.

Ms. Kapunan. These summaries, Your Honor, *hindi po ito* pre-marked, but we are now giving a copy to the Honorable Presiding Officer and to Counsel for the Respondent.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, kindly do so.

The Clerk of Court is instructed to reproduce the copy to be able to give each Senator-Judge with a copy of the table or summary.

Ms. Kapunan. For the record, Your Honor, while our witness is perusing this document, we have given a copy of what she is going over both to the Presiding Officer, through the Clerk of Court, Your Honor, and to the Respondent's Counsel.

And, again, for the record, this is for the first quarter, February 6-March 29, 2023, consisting of 519 documents in that summary, and second quarter of the Office of the Vice President, covering the period April 25 to June 30, 2023, consisting of 1,049 documents, Your Honor, total for both quarters.

And, Your Honor, we will be requesting, through the Clerk of Court, Your Honor, at some time, that these be marked as Exhibit—the tabulation being identified by the witness be identified for the first quarter as P-I-30-Q-1 and series, and tabulation for the second quarter be marked as Exhibit P-I-31-Q and series, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. The aforementioned tabulations and their summaries are hereby ordered to be so marked by the Clerk of Court at the appropriate time.

Ms. Kapunan. We have selected, for the first and second quarter, Your Honor, we have selected—for better appreciation of the Honorable Presiding Judge and our Senator-Judges, Your Honor—we have selected certain acknowledgment receipts which we request be shown to the witness when she is done.

The Presiding Officer. Assisting Counsel may approach.

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, just look at the summaries, please. You confirm that these summaries marked in evidence now are yours?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Tell us, tell us, walk us through. *Anong proseso ang ginawa mo sa paggawa mo ng mga* summary *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. During the evaluation *po*, I tabulated *po iyong* acknowledgment receipt *doon po* based *sa* date *kung kailan sila na*-execute, the expense, and the amount *po. Kaya ang nakalagay po sa* tabulation *ko* is the date, the amount, and the expense *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Iyong pangalan?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi na po namin na— hindi ko na po na*-tabulate *iyong sa* names.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. So, *nakalagay diyan iyong* amount, *iyong* date ...

Ms. Del Campo. And *iyong* expense.

Ms. Kapunan. ... *at iyong* expense. But if I show to you certain acknowledgment receipts which were part of the documents that you said were turned over to the COA-ICFAO office, would you be able to—*kapag ipinakita sa iyo* certain acknowledgment receipts *na parte ... na nasa* part *ng* tabulation or summary *mo,* would you be able to identify the same?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. I'll show you now. And with the kind permission of this Honorable Court, we have chosen certain acknowledgment receipts to be flashed on the screen, Your Honor, and being shown to the witness, marked as Exhibit P-I-8-1418 is a certain– is a certain Pia Piatos-Lim. Could you read the date, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dito po* is May 17, 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. Please be louder. Speak to the mic.

Ms. Del Campo. May 17, 2023 *na*-receive *po ni* Pia Piatos-Lim.

Ms. Kapunan. *Para saan ito* allegedly?

Ms. Del Campo. For the purchase of information *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And *may* signature *diyan sa ilalim.* Whose signature is this at the bottom?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po* is signature *po ng* admin staff *namin sa* ICFAO.

Ms. Kapunan. Who is your admin staff in ICFAO?

Ms. Del Campo. *Si Mr. Davin E. Baccay po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Davin Baccay?

Ms. Del Campo. Davin E. Baccay.

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, and that is his signature, administrative. *Ano ang* significance *nitong* sinayn (sign) *ng* administrative staff *ninyo ang* acknowledgment receipts*?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Pinapatunayan po nitong* certification *na ito na ito po iyong* copy *na sinabmit* (submit) *sa amin ng* OVP *na nasa* file *namin.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Pinapatunayan na ang binabasa mo ay kasama sa ibinigay ng* Respondent?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po. Kasama po ito sa binigay sa amin na* acknowledgment receipt in response *po sa* AOM.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *iyong* summary ng acknowledgment receipts for the first quarter and second quarter *ng* Office of the Vice President consisting of 1,049 separate acknowledgment receipts, *sabihin mo nga sa amin kung mayroong* similar signature *ang* all other acknowledgment receipts *ni* Mr. Davin Baccay?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po. Doon po sa mga* acknowledgment receipts *na ito is lahat po* sinertifay (certify) *ni* Mr. Baccay *na ito po ay mga kopya ng* acknowledgment receipts *na isinabmit* (submit) *po sa amin ng* OVP.

Ms. Kapunan. *Punta naman tayo sa* P-I-8-1483. *Pangalan ng*— Please read for the record.

Ms. Del Campo. Acknowledgment receipt, "This is to acknowledge receipt of the amount of ± 150,000 for the purchase of information; received by Ralph Josh Bacon on June 20, 2023."

Ms. Kapunan. Bacon. Okay. *Alas dose na, gutom na tayo.*

Iyong susunod na pangalan, mukhang—P-I-8-928. *Pakibasa* for the record.

Ms. Del Campo. Acknowledgment receipt, "This is to acknowledge receipt of the amount of ± 50,000 for the purchase of information, received by Anne Ongpauco; date, March 20, 2023."

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Next, P-I-8-1015. *Pangalan ni* Heart, Heart Santiago. *Pakibasa. Bumili siya ng* supplies.

Ms. Del Campo. "This is to acknowledge receipt of the amount of ± 250,000 for the purchase or rental of supplies, materials, and equipment for confidential operations (Payment for the purchase of supplies), received by Heart Santiago; date, Feb. 27, 2023."

Ms. Kapunan. *Kanina,* Madam Witness, *mayroong "Ongpauco" at saka mayroong "Heart." Tinanong mo ba kung sino ito at kung* related *sila sa* Presiding Officer *natin?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Hindi naman. Bakit hindi? Bakit hindi ka nag*-verify *ng mga pangalan? May pagkain na* bacon, *may parang kamag-anak ni Hea*rt. Why did you not verify the names in these 1,049 acknowledgment receipts?

Ms. Del Campo. *Sa* ICFAO *po kasi ang ginagawa namin* is compliance audit *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong ibig sabihin noon?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Itsine*-check *po namin kung* compliant *ba sa* joint circular *at kumpleto at* proper *ba iyong mga* liquidation documents *po na sina*-submit *sa amin* in relation *po sa* provisions *ng* joint circular.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Sinabi mo kung* proper *ba. Ito bang* payment of purchase of supplies, proper *ba iyan sa paggamit ng* confidential funds?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong* payment for supplies *po, kasama po siya doon sa* enumeration *kapag* payment for supplies *na ginamit po sa* confidential operations.

Ms. Kapunan. *At sinabi mo* earlier, *dapat iyong mga sina*-submit *may kasamang* sales invoice *at mga kasamang* purchase documents. *Mayroon bang kasama dito, sinabmit* (submit) *ni Ms. Heart?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Wala.* P-*I-8-1807, Feonna Villegas. Pakibasa.*

Ms. Del Campo. Acknowledgment receipt, "This is to acknowledge receipt of the amount of ± 500,000 for the purchase or rental of supplies, materials, and equipment for confidential operations (Purchase of provision of medical and food aid)."

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Nakalagay* "Purchase of medical and food aid." *Ito ba ay sang-ayon sa pinapayagan na paggamitan ng* confidential funds?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po dito, nakalagay po na* it is for the purchase of supplies *na naka-*open and close *po,* "Provision of medical and food aid."

Ms. Kapunan. P-I-8-1466, *kamag-anak yata ito ni* Senator Bong Revilla—Beth Revilla, ± 50,000, purchase of information. *Ang* purchase of information *ba ay* allowed? Allowable expense?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po,* under 4.8.1 *po, kasama po ang* purchase of information.

Ms. Kapunan. *Eh, kung kasama, bakit mo dinis-*allow *itong* purchase of information?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po ito kasama doon sa na-*disallow *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po?*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Balik naman tayo sa* P-I-8-1220. *Kamag-anak naman ito ni* Senator Risa Hontiveros. "Clarisse Hontiveros." Please read the amount.

Ms. Del Campo. "This is to acknowledge receipt of the amount of ± 500,000 for the purchase or rental of supplies, materials, and equipment for confidential operations (Purchase of provision of medical and food aid)."

Ms. Kapunan. *At,* again, disallowed *ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasama po ito doon sa na-*disallow *po kasi* based on these acknowledgment receipts, we cannot ascertain–*hindi ko po ma-*ascertain if this is really *nabigay for* purchase of medical and food aid, *kaya humingi pa po ako ng* additional documents.

Ms. Kapunan. *Nabigyan rin itong Jose Diokno Jr.? Kamag-anak ba ito ni* Public Prosecutor, Madam Witness? *Binerify* (verify) *mo ba*?

Can you look at P-I-8-1482? *Nagbigay ng* information *itong* Diokno.

Kapangalan, Jose Diokno Jr. Junior, baka anak ni congressman.

Hindi mo tinanong kanina noong dumaan ka diyan?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ah, hindi.* Okay.

Ito naman, I-8—P-I-8-994. *Kamag-anak naman ni Senator Lapid. Diane Maple Lapid na tumanggap ng* P150,000 *na bumili daw ng* supplies. *Pakibasa* for the record.

Ms. Del Campo. "This is to acknowledge receipt of the amount of P150,000 for the purchase or rental of supplies, materials and equipment for confidential operations," open—

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit*—sorry. Go ahead.

Ms. Del Campo. Open and close parenthesis—"(Payment for the Purchase of Supplies), received by Diane Maple Lapid on February 17, 2023."

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit naman naka-*disallow *itong* expense *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Gaya po iyon sa* provision and medical and food aid, based on these acknowledgment receipts *po, hindi po ma-*ascertain *kung* this is really given for the purchase of supplies, *kaya nanghingi po ako ng* additional documents *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Mayroon na naman,* not once, but for the second time, Lapid family, John A. Lapid Jr., *tumanggap ng* P350,000.

Can you read for the record? P-I-8-1735.

Ms. Del Campo. "Acknowledgment Receipt. This is to acknowledge receipt of the amount of P350,000 for the purchase or rental of supplies, materials and equipment for confidential operations (Purchase of Provision of Medical and Food Aid), received by John A. Lapid Jr.; date, May 3, 2023."

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, apart from these selected acknowledgment receipts, the total for the first quarter and the second quarter of the Office of the Vice President are similar acknowledgment receipts for purchase of medical and food aid, *pambili daw ng* supplies, *pambili ng iba-iba pa*; a*no ang masasabi mo sa mga* expenses *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Noong in-*evaluate *ko po, kasama po siya doon sa naging* findings *ko, at hinihingan ko po ng* additional documentation to ascertain *po na* these are paid *na pinambili po ng* supplies, medical, and food aid.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Noong sinabi mong humingi ka ng* additional information or documents, *nag-*submit *ba ang* Office of the Vice President *para patunayan talaga na itong* medical, grocery, *et cetera*, tables, *eh talagang ginamit sa* confidential funds?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasama po ito doon sa* Notice of Disallowance, and *iyong* Notice of Disallowance *po* is within the prescribed period *pa po sila para mag-*comply.

Ms. Kapunan. *Nag-*comply *ba sila*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala pa po silang naging aksiyon* after *ma-*receive *nila ito.*

Ms. Kapunan. So, despite *na binigyan Ninyo—ng* COA-ICFAO—*ng* opportunity *para mag-*submit *ng* additional documents *para mapatunayan nila* or *mag-*explain *man lang bakit nandiyan ang mga pangalan na iyan at bakit walang mga resibo na in-*attach *para pang-*liquidate, *nag-*submit *ba ang* Office of the Vice President *ng* additional documents after this Notice of Disallowance?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dahil nga po nabanggit ko na naging* Notice of Disallowance *po ito, ang* remedy *po nila* is to appeal *po sa* Commission Proper *and nandoon pa po sila sa* period with—to appeal *po sa* Commission Proper.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Ngayon,* what other *ano, mayroon pa bang ibang dokumento na sinabmit* (submit) *ang* Office of the Vice President *na sinama sa* response *nila*?

Ms. Del Campo. *May sinab—*to support *po* the payment of rewards, *nag-*submit *po sila ng* certification *ni Colonel Raymund Dante P. Lachica*, together with the protective intelligence operations report.

Ms. Kapunan. If shown to you, will you be able—*kung ipakita sa iyo itong* document Exhibit P-I-12-g, *isang* certification dated April 4, 2024—stipulated document with the Defense, Your Honor—please identify the same, also being flashed on the screen.

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, ito po iyong* certification *na naka-*attach *sa* response *ng* OVP.

Ms. Kapunan. Correction, Your Honor, it's not stipulated.

What relation does this certification have to the one you mentioned?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po iyong* same certification *na naka-*attach *po sa* response *ng* OVP.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano naman ang* significance? *Bakit—anong* significance *nitong* certification *na sinabmit* (submit) *nila*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ay isinabmit* (submit) *nila* to support *po* the payment of rewards. Under *po kasi sa* joint circular, '*pag may* payment of rewards, *dapat po* subject *ito sa tatlong* conditions. *And kasama po iyon, iyong* documents evidencing success of the information gathering and/or surveillance activities.

Ms. Kapunan. *Noong nag-*testify *dito si Attorney Wamil, sinabi niya noong tinanong siya ng* Prosecution: "*Ito ba ay* compliant?" *At ang sagot niya ay: "Ito ay pro forma."* Copy-paste *ang sinabi ng* Prosecution. *Kino-*confirm *mo ba iyan, na ito ay parang* annex?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito pong* certification *na ito, hindi po ito kasama doon sa* annexes *sa* joint circular. *Ang sinasabi po niyang* certification is *iyong* certification *ng* accountable officer. I*yon po iyong kasama sa* annexes *sa* joint circular.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *ano nga ang* significance *nitong* certificate, if you know?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po iyong sinabmit* (submit) *nila para po* as proof of success of the information-gathering and surveillance activities *po* to support the payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. Together with this, *mayroon rin sinabmit* (submit), earlier you mentioned, *ang* Office of the Vice President *ng tinatawag na* Protective Intelligence Operation Reports *o tinatawag na* PIOR *na in*-attach *nila sa* response. If shown to you, Madam Witness, will you be able to identify these PIORs?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. For the first and second quarters of the Office of the Vice President.

For the record, Your Honor, these Protective Intelligence Operations Reports or PIORs have been marked in exhibit—pre-marked as P-I-12-h up to P-I-12-h-9 and Exhibits P-I-12-m-1 up to P-I-12-m-13 for the Prosecution.

The Presiding Officer. Which, for the record, is I-115-OVP and series for the Respondent, correct, Attorney Kristine?

Ms. Ferrer. Yes, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Noted.

Please proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Thank you, Madam Witness.

As correctly noted by the Presiding Officer, Your Honor, although this witness is taking time, these are also pre-marked documents of the Defense, Your Honor, although they again refused to stipulate on the same.

Ms. Kapunan. Permission to sit down, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Sure, Attorney Lorna.

While we are waiting, Chair would like to inform the Senator-Judges and the Parties that we will be pausing for lunch break at 12, regardless of where we are, since, clearly, we might not be able to finish with the direct before 12. So, *kung saan man tayo abutan, hanggang doon lang din po tayo,* and we will continue after lunch.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, we will be able to finish before lunchtime with the Office of the Vice President.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, but not with the witness, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Not with the witness. And after lunch, Your Honor, with the DepEd because of the—

The Presiding Officer. Yes, understood.

Attorney Kristine, you can also sit down if you want to.

Ms. Ferrer. Thank you, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Attorney Lorna, next time, we can provide either a high chair for you so that you can sit while—

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, I think the Office of the Clerk misunderstood. I asked for a high chair; they gave me a high podium, Your Honor, which is making it more difficult, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. The Clerk of Court is so directed. I think it is more convenient to have a high chair.

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor. Thank you.

The Presiding Officer. I'd rather call it a high chair, Attorney Kapunan, than a bar stool.

Ms. Kapunan. With due respect, Your Honor, I am more familiar with bar stools.

The Presiding Officer. I would know. I would have thought, Counsel.

Yes, Ms. Xylene? Are you just about done, Ma'am?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Are you ready, Ms. Xylene?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*, Your Honor.

Ms. Kapunan. Thank you, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Attorney Lorna, you may proceed.

Ms. Kapunan. With the permission of this Honorable Court.

Thank you, Ma'am.

Madam Witness, you have gone over PIORs, or Protective Intelligence Operations Reports, which were attached to the Office of the Vice President's Response for the first and second quarter of 2023. Madam Witness, *sa tiningnan mong* reports *na iyan at na*-evaluate *mo na* reports *na iyan, ano ang mga* observation *mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Doon po sa* Protective Intelligence Operations Reports, *ito po ay in*-attach *nila kasama iyong* certification as documents evidencing success. And based *po sa aking* evaluation *ng mga* PIORs, *ang nakalagay po rito* is *ang* date and locations *ng mga* engagement *ng* Vice President, *kasama na din po iyong mga* satellite offices *nila. Nakalagay din po dito iyong* probable threats *doon sa mga* activities *na ito, pati na rin po iyong* narratives *ng* timeline of events *magmula sa* planning stage, actual operation, and post-operation. *Pero* during the evaluation *po ng* documents *na ito, hindi ko po nakita iyong* particular accomplishments *po na magwa*-warrant *sa* payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Bakit sinabi mo na—napakahaba ng mga dokumentong ito, bakit sinabi mo noong na*-evaluate *mo ay hindi mo nakita iyong hinahanap mo o iyong kailangang kasama nito sa mga dokumentong ito? Bakit*, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. Under *po kasi sa* Joint Circular, *iyon nga po, sa* "Payment of Rewards," it should be supported with documents evidencing success. *Pero* based *po sa mga* documents *na ito, ang nakalagay lang po doon sa* certification is a general statement that there were no untoward incidents *doon sa mga* engagement *ng* Office of the Vice President, together with the implementation *ng* programs, *pero hindi po ito naging sapat.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano-ano itong mga* programs *na sinasabi nila na pinaggamitan ng* confidential funds? *Wala ka bang nakita dito sa mga sinabmit* (submit) *na kadami-daming mga dokumento? Anong* specifics *nitong* activities allegedly *na pinaggamitan*?

Ms. Del Campo. *May mga* activities *po sa mga* meetings, *mga* attendance *po sa mga* festival, *ganoon po, at saka iyong mga* engagement *din po noong* satellite offices.

Ms. Kapunan. *Hindi ba* qualified *ito? Hindi ba* allowed *ito, iyong mga nagmi*-meeting, *nagmi*-meeting-meeting? *Paano mo malalaman?* How can you ascertain that these meetings are not—are indeed to discuss confidential activities?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasi po ang nakalagay lang po doon* is *kung ano iyong* activity *na in*-attend-*an* (attend) *doon po ng Vice President. Kasama na rin po iyong mga* program *ng mga* satellite offices *niya, pati po iyong* Libreng Sakay Program *ng* OVP.

Ms. Kapunan. Libreng Sakay Program?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, kasama po doon sa* PIORs.

Ms. Kapunan. *Hindi ba ito* confidential, *'yung libre na sakay na iyan?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano pa 'yung mga* activities *ng* satellite offices *na sinasabi mo na hindi naman tamang paggamit ng* confidential funds?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong mga—puwede pong mabalikan 'yung—*

The Presiding Officer. Assisting Counsel may approach.

Ms. Del Campo. *Dito po sa isang* satellite office *po nila sa Bacolod, ang nakalagay po rito na* activity *nila* is "Provided rice box to Murcia fire victims."

Ms. Kapunan. *Sandali.* Rice box to fire victims?

Ms. Del Campo. Murcia fire victims.

Ms. Kapunan. *Baka* confidential *ang* rice victims *na iyan,* Madam Witness.

Ms. Del Campo. *Tapos* TUPAD beneficiaries at BCNHS Gym.

Ms. Kapunan. Can you speak to the mic, please?

Ms. Del Campo. TUPAD beneficiaries at BCNHS Gym; DOLE TUPAD payout May 1, 2023, 198 recipients; daily wage for 50, a total of 841 cash disbursed 10 days.

Ms. Kapunan. *Mga* TUPAD beneficiaries, *nilista diyan kung magkano?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po 'yung mga naging* activity *po doon sa Bacolod.*

Ms. Kapunan. So, rice giving, TUPAD activities, *ano pa?*

Ms. Del Campo. Medical mission *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Medical mission.

Ms. Del Campo. Release of rice boxes to beneficiaries in Sebaste, Antique; visited MAIPP hospitals and provided GLs at billing accounting offices to get a copy of SOA. *Iyon po.*

The Presiding Officer. With indulgence of Counsel.

Ms. Xylene, these are the activities *na sinasabi nilang kinober* (cover) *noong* intelligence operations.

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po 'yung in-*attach *nila as* proof of success of the information gathering.

The Presiding Officer. *Ng* activities *nga*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

The Presiding Officer. Not that *ginamit 'yung* confidential fund *sa pagbigay ng bigas,* not that *ginamit 'yung* confidential fund *sa pagbigay ng* TUPAD, not that *ginamit 'yung* confidential fund sa MAIPP?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo. Bale po, ito 'yung naging* activities *ng* Vice President *po, pero hindi po 'yung* confidential fund *'yung ginamit dito.*

The Presiding Officer. *Na naging ligtas siya, 'ika nga, base sa* protective activities.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, parang* conducted surveillance activities *po sa mga programang ito.*

The Presiding Officer. Okay. You may proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Again, *para sa* record, *itong mga* activities *daw, 'yung mga* rice giving, *'yung mga* TUPAD *na iyan, doon siya nag-*conduct *ng* surveillance activities? *Iyon ba ang sinasabi mo,* Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang nakalagay po kasi doon sa* certification, *nag-*conduct *siya ng* confidential activity—surveillance activities before *po—parang ang pagkaka-intindi ko po dito* is *'yung nag-*conduct *sila ng* surveillance activities before the engagement of the Vice President *po. Parang ganoon.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At sinabi mo na kasama ito sa* Notice of Disallowance?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, kasi hindi napapakita ng mga dokumentong ito kasama 'yung* certification *na* there was success in the information-gathering and surveillance activities, *kasi 'yung* statement *lang po is* "There were no untoward incidents." *Hinahanap ko po kung ano 'yung—*

Ms. Kapunan. *'Pag sinabing*—Madam Witness, *'pag sinabing,* "There were no untoward incidents," *hindi ba* evidence of success *iyon? Walang—'yung mga komunista, 'yung mga terorista, imbes na nag-away-away eh tumanggap na lang ng* rice pack, *tumanggap na lang ng* TUPAD. *Hindi ba* success *iyon? Hindi sila nag-away-away?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang hinahanap ko po kasi dito,* sample *po doon sa isang* activity is, *nakalagay,* "probable threat CTG," *parang ganoon,* NPA *po. Ang hinahanap po kasi is* payment of rewards. *Mayroon bang—doon sa* probable threat *na iyon, may nahuli ba? Parang ganoon po, iyon ang magwa-*warrant *ng* payment of rewards *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At wala kang ganoon na nakita sa* evaluation *mo,* Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Going now to the third quarter of 2023, covering the period July 14 to September 30, 2023. *Anong* participation *mo,* if any, Madam Witness, *dito sa pag-*audit *ng* liquidation documents *na isinabmit* (submit) *ng* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ako po ang nag-*evaluate *ng* response *nila sa* Audit Observation for the third quarter *po ng* 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. *At,* Madam Witness, *ano ang nangyari,* if any?

Ms. Del Campo. *Noong ma-*issue *po 'yung* Audit Observation Memorandum *noong* August 8, 2024, *nag-*submit *po ang OVP ng* response *nila noong* August 27, 2024.

Ms. Kapunan. If shown to you the AOM, *'yung* Audit Observation Memorandum—this is a stipulated document, Your Honor, stipulated with the former witness, Atty. Wamil—Ah, with you? Oh, with you. What is the relation of this AOM dated August 8, 2024, marked as...

The Presiding Officer. Assisting Counsels may approach.

Ms. Kapunan. ...Exhibit P-I-12-i for the Prosecution and stipulated upon in the last hearing with Defense Counsel?

The Presiding Officer. As Respondent's Exhibit I-106-OVP.

Ms. Ferrer. Correct, Your Honor.

Ms. Del Campo. This is the same copy *po* of the AOM *na na-*issue *namin sa OVP.*

Ms. Kapunan. Now, showing to you and it is being flashed on the screen as it is being shown to you, *sa* last page, *pakitingin sa* last page, *mayroong* signature *diyan* over the name Nilda Plaras. Whose signature is this?

Ms. Del Campo. *Si* Assistant Commissioner Nilda Plaras *po ang* officer in charge *ng* ICFAO *noong ma-*issue *po ang dokumento na ito.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong ibig sabihin na pumirma ang isang Nilda Plaras na* Commissioner Associate—Assistant Commissioner *ng COA-ICFAO?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ay na-*review *at na-*approve *niya* and is ready for release *na po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Ano-ano,* if at all, *ang mga* findings or issues *na ni-*raise *mo na inaprub* (approve) *naman ng* Assistant Commissioner? *Ano-ano 'yung mga* issues *na nakalagay diyan sa* AOM or Audit Observation Memorandum, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang mga* issues *po dito sa* Audit Observation Memorandum *na ito* is, first, the submitted liquidation documents *po, wala pong naka-*attach *na* documentary evidence of payments.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, we request permission to flash this on the screen.

The Presiding Officer. Counsel may do so.

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong pangalawa naman po, 'yung* payment of rewards *na nagkakahalaga ng* P35 million were not supported with documents evidencing success. *Pangatlo po, 'yung* physical and financial plan, *hindi po naka-*specify *'yung* specific confidential activities. *At 'yung*

pang-apat po, 'yung Box E *ng* disbursement voucher *kung saan makikita 'yung* receipt of payment *ng SDO ng* cash advance *ay hindi po napirmahan.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit–Itong apat na* findings *na ipinakita natin ngayon, bakit hindi* compliant *ito at inilagay n'yo sa* notice *sa AOM?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong sa una po*, under the joint circular *po, dapat po ang* disbursement for confidential fund should be supported with documents evidencing payments *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po ito nai*-submit *sa amin kaya po hiningi namin sa AOM.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Iyong pangalawang* finding *na sinabi mo?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong pangalawa naman po, 'yung* payment of rewards. Under the joint circular, under item 4.8.5.B, it should be supported with documents evidencing success. *Pero doon sa* initial submission *po nila, walang naka*-attach *na* documents evidencing success to support the payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. *At 'yung pangatlong* finding, *bakit nasa AOM n'yo ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasi po 'yung sa* physical and financial plan *po nila, hindi naka*-specify *kung ano 'yung* confidential activities *na paggagamitan na magiging* basis *po ng* disbursement *ng* confidential fund.

Ms. Kapunan. *At,* Madam Witness, lastly, *'yung* findings *mo, 'yung pang-apat, bakit sinasabi n'yo na—bakit isinama ito sa* Audit Observation Memorandum?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong* Box E *po kasi ng* disbursement voucher *kung saan pumipirma 'yung SDO kapag na*-receive *na niya 'yung tseke* is *wala pong pirma 'yung* Special Disbursing Officer.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. After you issued this AOM, *ano ang ginawa,* if any, *ng* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. After *po nilang mag*—after *nilang ma*-receive *itong* Audit Observation Memorandum, *nag*-submit *po sila ng* response *noong* August 27, 2024.

Ms. Kapunan. And, if shown to you, *'pag ipinakita sa iyo itong* response dated August 27, 2024, would you be able to identify the same?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, please, witness is looking at Exhibit P-I-12-j. Again, despite this being the response of the Vice President herself, Counsel for Defense did not stipulate on this document.

The Presiding Officer. But they marked it as Exhibit I-116-OVP and series, correct, Counsel?

Ms. Ferrer. Correct, Your Honor.

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Who signed this response, if you know?

Ms. Del Campo. *Si Atty. Zuleika T. Lopez at si Mr. Lemuel G. Ortonio po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Again, Madam Witness, you are familiar with these signatures for the same reason you stated?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, kasama po ito doon sa* specimen signatures *na naka*-attach *po sa* liquidation documents.

Ms. Kapunan. *Dito sa* response *ng* Office of the Vice President, *mayroon bang mga dokumento na sinama dito sa* response *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano-ano itong mga* documents?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nag*-submit *po sila ng* acknowledgment receipts as documents evidencing payments. *Tapos,* to support *po* the payment of rewards, *nag*-submit *sila ng* certification *ni* Colonel Raymund Dante P. Lachica, together with the protective intelligence operations report, *at 'yung panghuli pong* attachment *ay 'yung* warrant register.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. By agreement and upon direction of the Presiding Officer, we will be marking instead a tabulation of these acknowledgment receipts for the period July 14 to September 30, 2023, representing the third quarter liquidation—alleged liquidation expenses of the Office of the Vice President without—of course, without prejudice to the right to our opportunity to present them at the appropriate time separately to the appropriate witnesses in the future, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Duly noted.

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, if you are shown acknowledgment receipts, would you be able to identify them?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. We will not show them now, but did you prepare, if at all, a tabulation or summary of these acknowledgment receipts for the third quarter?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, mayroon po akong* tabulation.

Ms. Kapunan. Would you please show them to us?

We have copies, Your Honor, of these tabulations or summaries and, for the record, we are giving the Honorable Presiding Officer and Counsel for the Respondent copy of the summaries.

Madam Witness, these summaries that you prepared, tell us the process involved. *Ano-ano ang ginawa mo? Paano ka nakarating sa mga* tabulation *o* summary *na iyan*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Noong ma*-receive *ko po 'yung* documents *na sinabmit* (submit) *kasama po ng* response, *in*-encode *ko po 'yung mga* acknowledgment receipts *na naglalaman po ng* disbursement *nila* by date, activity, and the amount *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And we have selected a few of these acknowledgment receipts. If shown to you, please identify the same. P-I—being flashed on the screen. *Pakibasa nga ng mga pangalan dito.*

Ms. Del Campo. "Acknowledgment receipt; This is to acknowledge receipt of the amount of P130,000 for the purchase of information, received by name: Beverly Claire Pampano, date: September 9, 2023."

Ms. Kapunan. This is P-I-8-2051, in the name of Pampano.

P-I-8-2107, *Keso naman ito. Keso.* Please read.

Ms. Del Campo. Acknowledgment—

Ms. Kapunan. Cheese. In English, cheese. Matthew N. Keso, 7-15-23. *Magkano ito,* Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. P250,000 *po at na*-receive *ni* Matthew N. Keso *noong* July 15, 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ginamit* for payment of supplies.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ang susunod,* Nova Santos, P50,000, P-I-8-2147, payment for the purchase of supplies. Another one, P-I-8-2195 *sa isang* Salah Casim, 8/11/2023 for P180,000. *Itong* payment of supplies *na ipinakita natin, ito ba ay* allowable expense *ng* confidential funds?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po,* under 4.8.4 of the joint circular *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Purchase of supplies? Is this compliant with the joint circular?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon po, 'yung sa* purchase of supplies, based on the acknowledgment receipt

po na ito, hindi ko ma-ascertain *na talagang pinambili siya ng* supplies *kaya humingi po ako ng* additional documentation.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *inilagay sa* acknowledgment receipt "purchase of supplies," *hindi naman ine*-explain *saan binili 'yung* supply?

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala po. Ito lang pong* acknowledgment receipt *ang sinabmit* (submit).

Ms. Kapunan. *Saan ginamit 'yung* supply? *Wala din*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nakalagay lang po dito na* for confidential operation.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Lahat ng sinabi, 'no. At 'yung mga sinasabi ditong* payment of supplies *pa, kagaya nitong*—okay, P-I-8-1933, Renan Piatos, purchase of information *naman ito*. P-I-8-2258 *kay* Xiaome–Siomai? Xiaome Ocho, P100,000, purchase of supplies. Another one, P-I-8-2092 flashed on the screen, *sa isang Jay Kamote, P200,000,* payment of purchase of supplies, 8/11/2023. *At itong mangga. Gumawa 'ata ng* fruit salad *ito, may kamote, may mangga, may keso*. P-I-8-2262, Miggy Mango for P50,000. *Anong masasabi mo dito*, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong mga* acknowledgment receipts *po na* purchase of supplies, *hiningan ko po ng* additional documentation to ascertain *po na ipinangbili po talaga ito ng* supplies.

Ms. Kapunan. We will finish this. Kokoy Villamin, P-I-8-2064, P50,000. *Bumili daw siya ng* information. Last three–last four in this list, P-I-8-2635 for Contis, Connor Adrian, 9/20/2023 for P50,000, reward payment; P-I-8-2178, Honeylet Camille Sy, 8/3/2023, P350,000; P-I-8-2665, Kristine Applegate Estrada, P50,000 for reward payment; and last, but not the least, P-I-8-2010, *isang* Denise Tanya Escudero, August 25, 2023. *Bumili ng* information *itong* Escudero for P120,000, Madam Witness.

May Keso, *may* Escudero, *may* Honeylet, *may* Estrada. *Anong* observation *mo dito sa mga* selected ARs *na ipinakita sa iyo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong sa mga* payment of rewards *po, hindi po siya* supported *ng* documents evidencing success. *And iyon sa* purchase of supplies *po, hiningan ko po ng* additional documentation to ascertain *na ibinayad po talaga ito para sa* supplies *na ginamit sa* confidential operations.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, please, we just have three certifications for the Office of the Vice President and then we will go to the DepEd, but it's now 12 o'clock, and with the names Apple, *Keso, Mangga*, and *et cetera*, I think it is time for us to have lunch, Your Honor.

With the permission of this Honorable Court, request for continuance, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Of course, Counsel. If you think it is a good time to pause so that your direct examination may not be cut at an inappropriate time, the Chair will accede to that.

Ms. Kapunan. May we ask that the witness be temporarily excused, Your Honor?

The Presiding Officer. The witness is excused for lunch.

Kain ka muna, Ma'am Xylene.

Ms. Del Campo. Thank you po, Your Honor.

SUSPENSION OF TRIAL

With the permission of the Court, the trial was suspended.

It was 12:01 p.m.

RESUMPTION OF TRIAL

At 12:36 p.m., the trial was resumed.

DIRECT EXAMINATION OF THE WITNESS
(*Continuation*)

Ms. Del Campo. Good afternoon *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Before we ended the morning proceedings, you identified acknowledgment receipts, *tama*?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. *Maliban dito sa mga* acknowledgment receipts, what other documents were attached to the Office of the Vice President's response, if any?

Ms. Del Campo. To support *po* the payment of rewards, *nag*-attach *po sila ng* certification from Colonel Dante P. Lachica and the Protective Intelligence Operation Reports for the third quarter of 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. If shown to you these certifications *na minensiyon* (mention) *mo*, will you be able to identify the same?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Showing to you, Madam Witness, certification dated September 30, 2023, pre-marked as Exhibit P-I-12-k. Also being shown on the screen, with the kind permission of this Honorable Presiding Officer.

What relation does this certification have *sa sinabi mong in*-attach *sa* response *ng* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. This is the same copy *po ng* certification attached to their response.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano naman ang* observation or significance *nitong* certification?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ay in*-attach *nila* to support the payment of rewards. Under the joint circular *po kasi*, if it is for payment of rewards, it should be supported with documents evidencing success. And based on this document *po*, *hindi ko po nakita iyong* particular accomplishment that will warrant the payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. So *itong* certification *na in*-identify *mo*, compliant *ito sa* joint circular *na pinagbasehan mo ng* evaluation?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po*.

Ms. Kapunan. *Sinabi mo walang* supporting documents evidencing success. *Ano ba dapat ang mga dokumentong* supporting success *ng* operations?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa* joint circular, *wala pong in*-identify *doon. Ang sinabi lang* is documents evidencing success, *pero* based *sa* evaluation *ko dito sa dokumento na ito*, *hindi ko po nakita iyong* particular accomplishment *na* proof of success *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Also earlier, *sinabi mo na* together with the Vice President's response, *mayroon siyang in*-attach *na tinatawag na* protective intelligence operation reports, *tama*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po*.

Ms. Kapunan. If shown to you, *pag pinakita sa iyo itong* PIOR, Protective Intelligence Operation Report, would you be able to identify them?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Showing to you, Madam Witness, what was pre-marked as Exhibits P-I-12-l up to P-I-12-l-10. Tell this Honorable Court if these are the certifications on the Protective Intelligence Operation Report that you mentioned.

Likewise, with the permission of the Presiding Officer, being flashed on the screen for easy reference of the Impeachment Court.

The Presiding Officer. Will the tech kindly check *kung saan nanggagaling iyong ingay na iyon*?

For the record, witness is perusing, I presume, counsel, Exhibit P-I-12-1-1 up to P-I-12-1-10, the PIOR of the engagements of the Vice President, as well as the certification dated September 30, 2023, Exhibit P-I-12-K, respectively, Respondent's Exhibit I-1-16 OVP and series.

Ms. Kapunan. We would also like to manifest for the record, Your Honor, that despite these being prosecution's exhibits and marked as well separately as defense' exhibits, these being documents submitted to the COA-ICFAO, Your Honor, the Office of the Vice President, counsel for the Office of the Vice President or for the respondent refused to stipulate to these documents, Your Honor, for the record.

The Presiding Officer. The Clerk of Court is directed to kindly instruct the tech to check what's wrong with the mics. And the tech is directed to, he is allowed rather to come here to plenary to look at it, if necessary.

Counsel may proceed. I believe the witness is through perusing the documents.

Ms. Kapunan. Thank you, Madam Witness.

Having gone over these documents, Madam Witness, P-I-12-1 *hanggang* P-I-12-1-10 *na* reports *ng* Protective Intelligence Operations, *ano-ano ang mga* engagements *na nakita mo sa mga* reports *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Doon po sa mga* engagement *ni* vice president *iyong* attendance *po niya sa mga* meeting, *sa mga* commencement exercises *po*. *Tapos dito naman po sa mga* satellite offices *niya*, *may mga* tree planting activities *po*, *mga* courtesy visits and coordination meetings *po*. And *lahat po ng naging* engagement *nila* for the third quarters of 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. *Iyong mga nakalagay sa* third quarter *ng* report *na sinabi mo*, *ganoon din ang nilagay sa* first and second quarter *na tinestify* (testify) *mo kanina*?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, may mga* activities *na pareho po*, *mga* meetings, *mga* attendance *po sa iba-ibang* events.

Ms. Kapunan. Tree planting, meetings, award ceremony, *et cetera,* Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo*.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Sinabi mo rin kanina na hindi ito* compliant *sa* joint circular. *Dito sa mga sinabmit (submit) na in-*identify *mo*, compliant *na ba ito sa* joint circular?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi pa din po naipakita sa mga dokumentong ito iyong* particular accomplishment *na* will warrant the payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. *Pero* on clarification of the Presiding Officer, *tinanong kung ano ang hindi* compliant. *Iyong pagkakaroon ba ng* tree planting *o iyong sinasabi nilang* activity in connection with confidential funds? *Sa* tree planting *na iyan*, *ano ang nakikita mo na* activity in connection with alleged surveillance?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon po kasing nakalagay doon sa* certification, *nagkakaroon po sila ng* surveillance activities before *iyong mga* activities *na ito*.

Ms. Kapunan. Bago—Yes.

Ms. Del Campo. *Pero based po kasi sa* evaluation *ko*, *hindi po kasi naipakita dito kung ano iyong* particular accomplishment that will warrant the payment of rewards. *Gaya po sa isang* activity *na nakalagay nga po ang* probable threat is *iyong sa* CTG, *mga* NPA *ganyan po. Hindi po makita sa mga dokumentong ito na itong* probable threats *na ito*, *ano iyong naging* successful result? *Mayroon bang nahuli sa mga ito? Ganoon po iyong hinahanap namin as* support *sa* payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. *Pero itong sinasabi mong* evidence of success, *ilan ang* NPA *o ilan ang terorista*, *ilan ang komunistang nahuli*, *hindi ba iyan* confidential information *na hindi dapat nila i-*divulge, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Sa* COA *po kasi*, *hinihingi po namin iyon para mapatunayan talaga na naging totoo iyong* payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. *So, hindi puwedeng sabihin na, "Ay! Hindi namin puwedeng i-*divulge *kasi* confidential *iyan." Kailangan pa rin* under the joint circular *na mapatunayan iyong* success *noong panggastos ng* confidential funds *sa resulta na sinasabi na nabawasan ang terorista, nabawasan ang* insurgency? *Kailangan pa rin* document, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po para po mapatunayan iyong pagbibigay ng* payment of rewards.

Ms. Kapunan. After *itong* Office of the Vice President's response in relation *sa* third quarter expenditure, February 6 to September 30, 2023 *at saka sa* first and second quarter, *ano nangyari*? What happened next after all of these responses of the Office of the Vice President for the three quarters?

Ms. Del Campo. During *po* the evaluation *ng* responses *sa dalawang* AOM, *nagkaroon po ng* Committee on Good Government and Public Accountability hearings *po noong* November 2024 *at dito po nagkaroon ng* statement *si* Ms. Gina Acosta, *ang* special disbursing officer *ng* OVP, *na* by the directive of VP Sara, *binibigay po niya ang* cash advance for confidential fund *kay* Colonel Raymund Dante P. Lachica.

Ms. Kapunan. Before we go into that. Your Honor, please, Presiding Officer, this witness alluded or has testified that there was a Committee on Good Government and Public Accountability (CGGPA) hearing. *Kailan ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. November 2024 po.

Ms. Kapunan. Yes. For the understanding and appreciation of this Honorable Court, this was subject of a motion for judicial notice of the prosecution and the transcripts of that hearing as to its actual occurrence, as to what transpired, Your Honor, have been subject of judicial notice, Your Honor.

Madam Witness, *sinabi mo na nag-*testify *si* Ms. Gina Acosta, *nandoon ka ba sa* hearing *na iyon?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes po, *nandoon po ako sa* hearing *na iyon.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit ka nandoon sa* hearing *na iyon?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasama po ako sa* resource persons from COA *na um-*attend *po doon.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Na-*subpoena *ka ba?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes po.

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit ka sinubpoena* (subpoena)*?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasi ako po iyong* staff *na nag-*conduct *ng* evaluation po *noong mga* documents *na sinabmit (*submit) in relation *sa* liquidation *ng* confidential fund *ng* OVP *at* DepEd.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And you said that in that hearing of the Committee on Good Government and Public Accountability, *eh nag-*testify *ang isang* Ms. Gina Acosta. *Ito bang* Ms. Gina Acosta, *iyong sinabi mo kanina na* chief of staff—*Ah, hindi. Sino ito?* SDO *ng* Office of the Vice President?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes po, *si* Ms. Gina Acosta *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At nakilala mo siya sa* hearing *na iyon na nandoon talaga siya?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, nagpakilala po siya.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Nagpakilala siya sa iyo?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po, doon sa* hearing *po, kaya na-*identify *ko po na siya po iyon.*

Ms. Kapunan. And *anong sinabi niya? Anong narinig mong sinabi niya sa* hearing *na iyan?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Na* by the directive po of VP Sara *binibigay niya kay* Colonel Raymund Dante P. Lachica, head *ng* Vice Presidential Security and Protection Group, *iyong* cash advance *po* for confidential fund.

Ms. Kapunan. *Na sinabi kay* Gina Acosta *ng* Vice President *na ibigay niya kay isang* Colonel Lachica. *Sino itong* Colonel Lachica?

Ms. Del Campo. *Siya po iyong* head *ng* Vice Presidential and Security Group po *noong* time *na iyon.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Itong* Colonel Lachica, *hindi siya* senior disbursement officer? Special disbursement officer?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po siya ang* SDO.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano ang kinalaman ng isang* head *ng* security *sa* disbursement *ng* confidential funds *kung alam mo?*

Ms. Del Campo. Under po *kasi sa* joint circular, *nakalagay po doon sa* responsibility *ng* SDO *na siya iyong magdi*-disburse *ng* cash advance. And *mayroon din pong* provision under 6.1.1 *na,* "under no circumstance shall cash advance for confidential fund be transferred from one accountable to another" po.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *kung ano ang nakalagay sa* circular *na iyan,* 6.1.1, *iyon lang dapat ang* officer *na dapat mag*-disburse *ng pondo?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes po, *si* SDO *lang po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Eh, paano kung ang* vice president *mismo,* vice president, *iyong* head *ng* agency *ang siya mismong nag*-instruct *kay* Ma'am Gina Acosta, *na ibigay ni* Gina Acosta, *kaniyang* SDO, *kay* Colonel Lachica, *tama ba iyon sa palagay ninyo o sa* evaluation *ninyo,* Madam Witness?

Ms. Ferrer. [off-mike] Objection, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Kindly turn on the mic of the counsel for respondent, tech. And why is it off?

Ms. Ferrer. Hello—The witness is incompetent to answer that question.

The Presiding Officer. If she knows, Counsel. Witness may answer. If you know; if you know Xylene. If you don't, you can also say so.

Ms. Del Campo. Okay po. Thank you po, Your Honor.

Under po *kasi sa* joint circular, it is the SDO *na magdi*-disburse *ng* cash advance, and *ang* participation *po dito ng* head of agency is to oversee. *Kasama po sa* responsibility *niya* to oversee the agency-wide use *ng—kung paano po ginagamit ang* confidential fund.

Ms. Kapunan. So *ang sagot sa tanong ay—ano. Ang tanong ko ngayon sa sinabi mo, sa palagay mo, bakit ka nabahala na si* Ms. Acosta—

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor.

Ms. Kapunan. I have not yet asked the question, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Let the Counsel finish her question, Counsel for Respondent.

Ms. Kapunan. Why does it concern you, as you stated, that Ms. Acosta admitted to transferring the confidential funds...

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

Ms. Kapunan. ... to Colonel Lachica?

The Presiding Officer. Are you done, Attorney Kapunan?

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, Counsel for Respondent.

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, the witness did not say that she was concerned about it, so that's a leading question. Misleading, sorry. Misleading.

The Presiding Officer. Kindly reform, Counsel. You already established that the witness heard Gina Acosta, under oath, testified that she was instructed by the Vice President to give the funds to Colonel Lachica.

Ms. Kapunan. What observation or significance did you draw from the admission by Ms. Acosta in this Committee on Good Government and Public Accountability hearing? What observation or significance did you draw personally from this admission?

Ms. Del Campo. This is a direct violation *po ng* joint circular, specifically *iyong* Item 6.1.1 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Again, 6.1.1. Are you familiar, are you competent to testify on what 6.1.1 is?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasi po ang nakalagay dito* is *hindi po puwedeng ibigay ito ng* SDO *sa ibang* officer *po.*

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

The Presiding Officer. Counsel for Respondent.

Ms. Ferrer. The question is unresponsive, Your Honor. She was asked, "Why are you competent to testify on 6.1.1?" The answer, rather, is unresponsive.

The Presiding Officer. Witness is directed to answer yes or no if she is competent. She's going ahead of the horse.

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po. Kasi ang* basis *po ng* audit *namin* is the joint circular.

The Presiding Officer. Okay.

Atty. Kapunan, you may proceed.

Ms. Kapunan. What next did you do in relation to the liquidation of the OVP's confidential funds after this committee hearing?

Ms. Del Campo. After *po* the committee hearing, together—after *din po na ma-*evaluate *iyong mga* liquidation documents and *iyong mga* responses, I drafted *po* a Notice of Disallowance and *sinabmit* (submit) *ko po ito sa aking* division chief for her review.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. So, *ikaw mismo ang nag-*draft *ng* Notice of Disallowance?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong* basis *nito? Itong* notice of disallowance?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang una po is iyong* direct—*iyong kanina pong nabanggit ko na iyong* directive *ni* VP Sara *na ibigay ni* Ms. Gina Acosta *iyong* cash advance for CF *kay* Colonel Lachica, which is violation of under 6.1.1 of the joint circular. And after the violation *po ng*—after the evaluation *po ng* responses, the amount of P261,300,000 was also disallowed *kasi nga po iyong* payment of rewards amounting to P62 million were not supported with documents evidencing success.

And *iyong* purchases *po nila ng* supplies and provision of medical and food aid in a total amount of P199 million, based on the acknowledgment receipts *po, hindi ma-*ascertain *na* these are for purchase of supplies *kaya po nanghingi ako ng* additional documents *po.*

And *iyong pang-apat po* is, based *sa* evaluation *ng mga* acknowledgment receipts for the third quarter, *may* disbursement *po doon* for purchase of information *na nabayaran* before *ma-*release *iyong* cash advance *na nagkakahalaga ng* P300,000.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. So, *dahil dito sa mga* reasons *na iyan, eh nag-*issue *ka ng* notice of disallowance. If shown to you *itong* notice, will you be able to identify the same?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, please, can we ask Atty. Dela Cruz to show—

The Presiding Officer. Assisting Counsel may approach.

Ms. Kapunan. This has been pre-marked as Exhibit P-I-13-f, Your Honor, for the Prosecution.

The Presiding Officer. And for the record, respondent's I-9.

Please proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor. Again, for the record, this is likewise the Respondent's exhibit, the same as Prosecution, which again they refuse to stipulate on.

How much, Madam Witness, was disallowed in your notice of disallowance?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong buong* amount *po na* P375 million.

Ms. Kapunan. Three hundred seventy-five million. *Anong* period *ang* covered *nitong* P375 million *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Bale, ito po ay* for the three quarters of 2023. *Tig*-125 *po* per quarter.

Ms. Kapunan. And this is being flashed on the screen as well. *Sino-sino ang* responsible persons in connection *sa* Notice of Disallowance *na in*-issue *ng* COA-ICFAO dated March 31, 2026?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang mga* persons *po ay sina* VP Sara; the SDO, Ms. Gina Acosta; *ang* chief accountant, Ms. Julieta Villadelrey; *at si* Colonel Raymond Dante P. Lachica *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Now, you said that Respondent Duterte—Sara Duterte, is accountable. Why? *Bakit* accountable *ang* Vice President Sara Duterte?

Ms. Del Campo. Because she approved *po* the transactions and the utilization of the cash advance *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. *Saan iyan—saan nakalagay sa mga dokumento ang in*-approve *ng* Vice President *mismo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong sa* accomplishment report *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. *Sa mga lahat ng* accomplishment reports.

Ito naman, Ms. Gina Acosta, why do you say that she is also accountable?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasi po siya ang* special disbursing officer *at* responsibility *po niya na i*-disburse *ang* cash advance.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Pag sinabing* "accountable," *hindi naman tayo* accountant, *ano sa* layman's term, *ang ibig sabihin ng* accountable?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong taong may pananagutan po doon sa pondo na ibinigay sa kanya.*

Ms. Kapunan. *May pananagutan.* So, *ang* Sara Duterte, Vice President, *may pananagutan.*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit? Anong* nature *ba ng pondo na iyan*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasi po ito* is *pondo ng bayan po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Pondo ng bayan.* In English *naman ay* public funds. *Baliktad.*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Ms. Gina Acosta, *bakit naman siya* accountable?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dahil siya po ang* designated *na* special disbursing officer and responsibility *po niya na i*-disburse *ang* cash advance.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *At bakit, hindi ba niya ginawa iyong kaniyang* responsibility *na mag*-disburse?

Ms. Ferrer. Objection, Your Honor. Leading question.

Ms. Kapunan. Why do you say that she is an accountable officer?

The Presiding Officer. Reform, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. What?

The Presiding Officer. No, you already did.

Ms. Kapunan. I reformed, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. I know. I know. You already did. Please continue.

Ms. Del Campo. *Puwede pong paulit iyong tanong*?

Ms. Kapunan. You mentioned that Gina Acosta *ay* accountable officer *din. Bakit?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Dahil sa kaniya po ibinigay iyong* cash advance for—*siya po ang dinesigneyt* (designate) *na* special disbursing officer *at siya po iyong* accountable *doon sa pag-*disburse *ng* cash advance for confidential fund.

Ms. Kapunan. *Sinabi mo na naging basehan mo ang* joint circular. *Saan naman nakalagay ito sa* joint circular *na isang* SDO *ang dapat* responsible *sa pag*-disburse *ng tinatawag na* public funds?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nakalagay po ito doon sa* responsibility *niya,* and *gaya ng nabanggit ko po kanina doon sa* item 6.1.1 *na hindi ito puwedeng i*-transfer from one accountable to another.

Ms. Kapunan. Incidentally, *pag ganyan sa mga* companies, *iyong mga nagha*-handle *ng mga pondo ay may* bond. *May* bond na *tinatawag, 'no? Dito ba sa* Office of the Vice President, accountable public disbursement officer ...

Ms. Ferrer. Objection.

Ms. Kapunan. ... *saan kaya, mayroon ba sa* circular *ang nakalagay na kailangang magbigay ng* bond *ang* SDO?

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, Counsel for Respondent.

Ms. Ferrer. Leading question.

The Presiding Officer. I'll consider it preliminary, Counsel, because I think it's a given that SDO should have a bond.

Kindly answer, Madam Witness.

Ms. Del Campo. *Nakalagay po ito sa* joint circular.

Your Honor, *puwede po bang mag*-refer *ako sa* joint circular?

The Presiding Officer. You may, Ma'am Xylene.

Ms. Del Campo. *Nakalagay po ito doon sa* item 6.1.2, *na sabi po dito*, "Cash advances for CF and/or IF shall be drawn by duly designated and bonded SDOs or head of agency for the implementation of a program, activity, and project."

The Presiding Officer. That would be enough.

Ms. Kapunan. May I proceed?

The Presiding Officer. Counsel may proceed.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. So, *sa binasa mo, ang* SDO *ay dapat magbigay ng* bond. Do you have any knowledge if this Gina Acosta gave a bond pursuant to the joint circular provision that you read?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, naka*-attach *po ito doon sa* liquidation documents. Required *po ito sa* joint circular.

Ms. Kapunan. *At magkano naman? Kung ang* amount *ng* Office of the Vice President confidential funds *ay* P500 million, *magkano naman ang* bond *na—Sinabi mo, naka*-attach *ang*

dokumento sa mga sinabmit (submit) *ng* OVP, *magkano ang* bond?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi ko na po maaalala iyong kung magkano, pero* based *po sa* evaluation *ng mga* documents, enough *naman po iyong* bond *ng* SDO *para i*-cover *iyong* cash advances *niya.*

Ms. Kapunan. If the amount—Is the amount stated, if you recall?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi ko na po maaalala iyong* exact—*iyong kung magkano iyong* bond. *Pero* during the evaluation *po, hindi po namin naging* findings *iyon.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Ngayon naman,* if the SDO is a bonded—*at sinabi mo si* Gina Acosta *ay may* bond, in the provision that you read, is it allowed for Gina Acosta, *isang* bonded *na* senior special disbursement officer, *na mag*-transfer *ng kaniyang* responsibility *sa isa pang* officer?

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, Counsel?

Ms. Ferrer. Leading question, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Actually, I would have sustained it because she—asked and answered. Already answered, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. You said—I will reform, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, she already answered that question earlier.

Kindly reform, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ito namang* Ms. Villadelrey, why did you say she is an accountable officer?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dahil po doon sa* liquidation report, *sinertify* (certify) *niya na* complete and proper *iyong mga* liquidation documents *po, pero* upon the evaluation *po, hindi po ito* complete and proper.

Ms. Kapunan. And Colonel Lachica?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dahil po siya ang nag*-disburse *ng* cash advance despite not being the special disbursing officer *ng* Office of the Vice President.

Ms. Kapunan. And why is that—Is this among your observations?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And what did your observation indicate about Colonel Lachica?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon nga po, iyong naging—Ito po iyong isang mga* ground *kung bakit po na*-disallow *iyong* total *ng* P375 million.

Ms. Kapunan. *Sa pagkaalam namin*—Based on our understanding, *may mga* stages *iyan, ano? Ang unang* stage *ng* evaluation *ay* Audit Observation Memorandum, *tama*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And in the case of the Office of the Vice President, *naka*-issue *kayo ng* AOM?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ang* next stage *dapat diyan ay ang* Notice of Suspension, *tama*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Now, in the case of the Office of the Vice President, *pagkatapos nagbigay ng* response *ang Office of the Vice President sa AOM na in*-issue *ninyo, anong nangyari? Mayroong— anong ginawa ng Office of the Vice President?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Nag*-respond *po sila sa* AOM *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. So, *nag*-respond *sa* AOM. Did the response address—*Sinagot ba ng* response *na iyan ang lahat ng* observations, *lahat ng* non-compliance, *lahat ng* discrepancy, deficiency *na pinoynt* (point) out *ninyo sa* AOM?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa* evaluation *ng mga* responses together with the attached documents *po, hindi pa rin po ito naging* compliant *sa* joint circular.

Ms. Kapunan. And what did you do? What did your office do, if any?

Ms. Del Campo. *Kaya po nag-*issue *po kami ng* Notice of Disallowance.

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit,* Madam Witness? *Sa pagkaalam natin, pagkatapos ng* AOM, *dapat* Notice of Suspension. *Bakit ninyo agad in-*issue *ang isang* Notice of Disallowance *at hindi na kayo nagbigay ng* Notice of Suspension *muna? Bakit dineretso ninyo sa* disallowance?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dahil nga po sa naging* statement under oath *ni* Ms. Gina Acosta *na ibinigay niya iyong—na* by the directive of VP Sara, *ibinigay niya kay* Colonel Lachica *iyong* cash advance for CF, which is a violation *po ng* joint circular, making it irregular *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Apart from this joint circular of 2015, *mayroon*—please confirm *kung mayroong mga* rules and regulations *na in-*issue *ang* COA *para sa mga* settlement of accounts, if you know.

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* basis *po namin is iyong* rules and regulations on settlement of accounts *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong ibig sabihin noon? Anong* particular provision?

Ms. Del Campo. *Puwede pong pakiulit iyong tanong?*

Ms. Kapunan. *Sinabi mo na mayroong* rules and regulations on settlement of accounts.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, mayroon po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At,* instead of a Notice of Suspension, *diniretso ninyo agad sa* Notice of Disallowance.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong pinagbasehan ninyo nito?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Dahil nga po ang* definition *po ng* Notice of Disallowance based on the joint circular is *iyong* transaction *po* appears to be illegal, improper, or irregular. And in this case *po, iyong naging* transfer *po is a* direct violation making the transaction irregular *kaya naging* Notice of Disallowance *na po iyong in-*issue *namin.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Sige. So itong pag-*transfer *ng responsibilidad sa* disbursement *na hindi naman* special disbursement officer *ay, sinabi mo,* illegal?

Ms. Del Campo. *Doon po siya sa* irregular, which is a violation *po siya sa* joint circular.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. So *iyong* joint circular *nakalagay,* illegal, improper, *at* irregular. *Ang sinasabi mo ay* "irregular."

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At bakit* irregular *ulit?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Kasi po hindi po siya—*

Ms. Ferrer. Asked and answered, Your Honor, asked and answered.

The Presiding Officer. Asked and answered, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. What is the status of this Notice of Disallowance at present, if you know?

Ms. Del Campo. Nasa—

Ms. Ferrer. Asked and answered already, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. I don't quite remember, Counsel. It will be okay to repeat.

Ms. Kapunan. It was not asked yet, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. It would be okay to repeat, nevertheless.

Yes, Xylene.

Ms. Kapunan. What is the status of this Notice of Disallowance?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nasa* prescribed period *pa po ang* OVP *para po mag*-appeal *sa* Commission Proper *po.*

The Presiding Officer. With the indulgence of Counsel, and what is the prescribed period to appeal before the Commission?

Ms. Del Campo. One hundred-eighty days *po, after nila ma*-receive *iyong* Notice of Disallowance.

The Presiding Officer. Six months.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

The Presiding Officer. You may proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. And to your knowledge, is this—are they still well within this six-month period to submit?

Ms. Ferrer. Asked and answered already, Your Honor.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor please, it is within—this is follow-up to the question of the Presiding Officer—what is the period? One hundred-eighty days. My question is: is the 180 days still currently applicable?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Next, Madam Witness—are you still okay?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Punta naman tayo dito sa* Department of Education.

The Presiding Officer. Before you move on Counsel, with the indulgence of Attorney Kapunan.

Ma'am Xylene, so *dahil ibinigay diumano kay* Lachica *ni* Gina Acosta *dinis*-allow *ninyo na lahat?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, kasi* direct violation *po ito ng* joint circular.

The Presiding Officer. *Subalit dahil hindi iyan dumaan sa* notice of suspension *in*-issue *ninyo iyong* notice of disallowance *nang hindi binibigyan ng pagkakataon sumagot muna o magpaliwanag ang* OVP—*wala pa po sila? Ngayon pa lang, kung saka-sakali, kung mag-a-*appeal *sila?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

The Presiding Officer. So, you have not heard the side of the Vice President or the OVP's office with respect to what you heard Gina Acosta say under oath in the House hearings? *Wala pa silang* response *doon?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala pa po. Doon na lang po sa* appeal.

The Presiding Officer. *Doon na lamang.* So *in*-issue *ninyo ito nang hindi naririnig iyong panig nila?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

The Presiding Officer. You may proceed, Counsel, to the DepEd.

Ms. Kapunan. What is your participation, Madam Witness, in the post-audit of the confidential funds of the Department of Education for the first quarter and second quarter of 2023—covering the periods February 20 to March 30, 2023 for the first quarter and for the second quarter, April 25 to June 30, 2023? *Ano ang* participation *mo,* if any, *sa* post-audit *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ako po iyong nag-e*-evaluate *ng* response *ng* DepEd *sa* audit observation

memorandum *na na*-issue *sa kanila* for the first and second quarters of 2023 *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. You also said earlier that *noong na*-transfer *na si* Mr. Wamil, *na sinundan mo, ay nag*-issue *siya bago siya umalis ng isang* AOM dated February 1, 2024. Do you confirm that?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo. Tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And to your knowledge, *nagbigay ba ng sagot o* response *ang* Department of Education, *na ang* head of agency *ay si* Vice President Sara Duterte? Mayroon bang response *ang* office ng DepEd sa AOM dated February 1, 2024 *na in*-issue *ni* Mr. Wamil?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, nag*-submit *po sila ng* response *noong* April 17, 2024.

Ms. Kapunan. And if I show you a copy of this response dated April 17, 2024, *maa*-identify *mo ba siya?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Showing to you now the Department of Education's response pre-marked as Exhibit P-I-21-b.

The Presiding Officer. And for the Respondent, I-9? Counsel, correct?

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, it's D-I-79-DE.

The Presiding Officer. Noted.

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, *ano ang* relation *nitong* document *na in*-identify *mo sa sinabi mong isinabmit na* response *ng* DepEd Secretary?

Ms. Del Campo. This is the same response *po na isinabmit sa amin ng* DepEd.

Ms. Kapunan. Please look at this document. *Mayroon nakalagay sa* last page, *kaninong* signature *ito, kung alam mo?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Kay* Attorney Michael Wesley T. Poa *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Attorney Michael. Who is this Attorney Michael Poa?

Ms. Del Campo. Based on this document *po*, undersecretary and chief of staff.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Why are you familiar with his signature?

Ms. Del Campo. *Doon po sa dalawang* documents *na na*-evaluate *ko, pareho po iyong* signature *niya doon sa dalawang* transmittal letters *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. What were the attachments, if you recall, to this response of the DepEd?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nag*-submit *po sila ng* acknowledgment receipts, certification from the relevant partners, specifically the Armed Forces of the Philippines.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano pa*?

Ms. Del Campo. *At saka po* fully accomplished *na* disbursement voucher. And *mayroon din po pala silang sinabmit na* DepEd Order No. 1.

Ms. Kapunan. You mentioned *na may in*-attach *sa* response *na* acknowledgment receipts for the first quarter and for the second quarter by the DepEd. If shown to you, will you be able to identify them?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. For the first quarter of the DepEd, you have made a summary, please confirm, Madam Witness, of 561 acknowledgment receipts.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. For the period February 20 to March 30, 2023, *mayroon kang* summary *na ginawa?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, mayroon po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Dala mo ba iyong* summary *na iyan?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, please, the witness is producing a summary of 561 acknowledgment receipts for the first quarter liquidation expenses of confidential funds of the Department of Education.

The Presiding Officer. Observation of counsel is noted. You may proceed.

Ms. Kapunan. We are giving copies to Respondent's counsel and to this Honorable Presiding Officer through the Clerk of Court.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, please. The Clerk of Court, through the OSAA, is directed to kindly get the copy.

You may proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. We request, Your Honor, that this tabulation for the first quarter prepared by the witness be marked as Exhibit P-I-33.

Madam Witness, for the second quarter of the DepEd, attached to the DepEd's response is 619 acknowledgment receipts. Do you confirm that?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. This is for the period April 25 to June 30, 2023?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Do you have that summary with you?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, mayroon po.*

The Presiding Officer. Same order. Kindly mark it and furnish the opposing counsel as well as the Court with a copy.

Ms. Kapunan. For the record, Your Honor, the first quarter is 561 acknowledgment receipts. The second quarter is 619 acknowledgment receipts. So, the summaries of quarter one and quarter two consist of 1,180 acknowledgment receipts, Your Honor.

We request that this be marked as Exhibit P-I-34 for the second quarter.

The Presiding Officer. Noted.

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, *anong proseso ang ginamit mo sa paggawa ng* evaluation *o* tabulation *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Gaya po ng ginawa ko rin sa* OVP, *tinabuleyt* (tabulate) *ko po ito* by date, *iyong* activity, and the amount *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And familiar *ka sa mga* ARs *na ito*, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. And if shown to you—we will show you some selected examples— also going to be flashed on the screen.

Showing to you Exhibit P-I-17-29 being flashed on the screen.

Madam Witness, *anong pangalan ang nakalagay dito?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Pirma lang po. Ay, hindi ko po mabasa kung pirma ito pero wala pong—*

Ms. Kapunan. *Walang pangalan pero may pirma?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. And *anong place na in-*issue*?*

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa dokumento ang* address *po* is Danao.

Ms. Kapunan. *At ang* date?

Ms. Del Campo. February 21, 2023 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. February 21, 2023, for *magkano?*

Ms. Del Campo. Fifty thousand pesos *po* for the payment for information.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Can you read the others? P-I-17-81, Alfred Avanta.

Ms. Del Campo. *Nakalagay po,* "Acknowledgment Receipt, date: February 21, 2023, received the amount of P100,000 in payment for supplies. Payee: Alfred Avanta, Address: Malolos."

Ms. Kapunan. Next, P-I-17-288, Mary Santilliano. *Saang* place *in*-issue *ito,* Madam Witness, based on the document?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa* document, *ang* address *pong nakalagay is* Davao City.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Anong* date *nito?*

Ms. Del Campo. February 21, 2023 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. The same date, February 21, 2023. Okay. *Galing* Malolos, *pumunta ng* Davao.

Negros Occidental *naman.* P-I-17-382, Amy Liu. *Magkano ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. Forty-five thousand *po* in payment for rental safehouse.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ang* date?

Ms. Del Campo. February 21, 2023 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And place is?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang nakalagay po sa dokumento na* address is Negros Occidental.

Ms. Kapunan. For the next one, P-I-17-492. *Kaninong pangalan ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Pirma lang po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Walang pangalan, may pirma. Saan namang* place *ibinigay ang perang ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. San Francisco, Agusan del Sur, *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. So, from Negros Occidental, *pumunta ng* Agusan.

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please, Your Honor—

Ms. Kapunan. *Magkano ang*—there is no question yet.

The Presiding Officer. Kindly—

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano ang* date—

The Presiding Officer. I know where you're getting at, but kindly finish your question, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong* date ang *in*-issue *nito,* based on this document?

Ms. Del Campo. Ang date *po is* February 21, 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. The next document—

The Presiding Officer. Counsel for the Respondent, yes?

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, can the Counsel be reminded not to make any inferences on the document, Your Honor, like from Malolos, *pumunta ng* Negros, *pumunta ng* Agusan.

The Presiding Officer. Counsel is so reminded, just ask your question to the witness. Let the witness be the one to respond to whatever elicitation or admission you want to get, Counsel. You may proceed.

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor, we will comply although it's self-evident that all these documents are dated February 21, 2023.

Like the next one, P-I-17-493 in the name of Andre Galor. Where was it issued, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa* document, *ang* address *po is* Makati City.

Ms. Kapunan. And what date?

Ms. Del Campo. February 21, 2023 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. For what amount, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. One hundred thousand *po* for the payment of rental safehouse.

Ms. Kapunan. And the last in this first set is P-I-17-574. Is there a name? *Anong pangalan ang nakalagay sa dokumento?*

Ms. Del Campo. Minda Lacson *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong* date?

Ms. Del Campo. February 21, 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong* place?

Ms. Del Campo. Negros Oriental *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, based on these seven selected documents presented to you, do you confirm that there is only one date of disbursement?

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

The Presiding Officer. Asked and answered, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. February 21, 2023 is the uniform dates in all of these documents, Madam Witness.

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

Ms. Kapunan. I have not yet asked the question.

The Presiding Officer. No, you already did.

Ms. Ferrer. Asked and answered, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. You already did, Counsel, if it's the uniform date.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. What significance can you draw or observation can you make for these six documents issued on the same dates in seven different places from Danao, Malolos, Davao, Negros, Agusan, Makati City, and Negros Oriental? What observation can you make, if any, as regards these acknowledgment receipts that you identified?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po dito sa mga* acknowledgment receipts *na ito, lahat po sila* is dated February 21, 2023, and *naibigay po sila sa iba-ibang* addresses *po na nakalagay dito.*

Ms. Kapunan. You mentioned earlier on testimony that you have audited many national agencies, correct?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And at least 30, if I recall right? At least 30 national agencies?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Based on your evaluation, how many government or national agencies have had similar submissions on acknowledgment receipts, if you recall? Same date, different locations, different names— how many, based on your recollection, national or local government agencies have submitted acknowledgment receipts of this nature?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi ko na po mabilang, pero may mga nagsa*-submit *din po ng* acknowledgment receipts *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ang tanong sa iyo:* acknowledgment receipts *na pare-parehong araw pero iba-ibang* location, *mayroon ka bang maalala*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Parang wala. Wala naman po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Wala.* Okay.

Going now to several acknowledgment receipts, which we will show you—please go over this.

Again, acknowledgment receipts by way of liquidation for the DepEd. Can you please go over this one by one, being flashed on the screen? First is P-I-17-7 for Geraldine Omoy. What date is stated there?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nakalagay po dito*, February 25, 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. And place?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nakalagay po sa dokumento na ito, ang* address *po is* Masbate.

Ms. Kapunan. *Magkano*?

Ms. Del Campo. Two hundred thousand *po* for the payment of reward.

Ms. Kapunan. Next, P-I-17-87, *kaninong pangalan ang nandiyan*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Pirma lang po iyong nakalagay.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Walang pangalan. Saan in*-issue?

Ms. Del Campo. *Sa* Laoag City *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong* date?

Ms. Del Campo. February 25, 2023 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. For how much?

Ms. Del Campo. One hundred thousand *po* for the payment for supplies.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. P-I-17-88 to Mr. Jaime Aquino from Davao City. *Magkano*?

Ms. Del Campo. Forty-five thousand *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And what date?

Ms. Del Campo. February 25, 2023 *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Next, P-I-17-127, whose name is it, what amount, and what date?

Ms. Del Campo. *Pirma lang po, tapos ang* date *po niya is* February 25, 2023. *Ang nakalagay po na* address *is* Agusan del Norte.

Ms. Kapunan. Next, Madam Witness, Rex Napoles. P-I-17-128. What date, what place, and what amount is stated?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* date *po is* February 25, 2023. P50,000 in payment for transport rental or expenses, *ang* address *po na nakalagay is* Olongapo.

Ms. Kapunan. P-I-17-169, Madam Witness. Whose name, what is the date, the place, and the amount?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* date *po* is February 25, 2023, in the amount of P40,000 for the payment of information. Address *po* is Samar.

Ms. Kapunan. P-I-17-213, Eduardo Tan. What date and where was it disbursed, and what amount?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nakalagay po sa dokumento,* date February 25, 2023. *Ang* amount *po* is P150,000 in payment for reward. *Ang* address *po* is Masbate.

The Presiding Officer. With indulgence of Counsel, so as not to belabor the point. Based on your understanding, Ma'am Xylene, *iyong* address *po bang nakalagay sa ibaba*, address *kung*

saan ibinigay iyong pera o address *ng tao? Sa pagkakaunawa ninyo po.*

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po dito sa—Dahil po* documents evidencing payment, *iyong* address *po dito* is *iyong kung saan po ibinayad.*

The Presiding Officer. So, *ang ibig sabihin pro forma* document *po ba iyan?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po ito kasama sa* annexes *sa* Joint Circular.

The Presiding Officer. So, *hindi ito pro forma?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po.*

The Presiding Officer. So, *sa pagkakaunawa ninyo lamang po na ang* address *na nakalagay diyan*, address *kung saan ibinigay?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes po.

The Presiding Officer. *Hindi* address *kung taga-saan sila?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo. Kasi based po sa—Ito po ay* documents evidencing payment, so *iyong* address *dito* is *kung saan po binayaran.*

The Presiding Officer. And that is reflected in the AOM you issued with respect to the first and second quarter?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po.*

The Presiding Officer. *Wala sa* AOM *iyan?*

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala po.*

The Presiding Officer. Okay. Counsel, you may proceed.

Ms. Kapunan. Mr. Lito Saludores, P-I-17-237. What date was it issued or paid? *Saan ibinayad ang pera, anong* date, *at anong* amount?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* date *po* is February 25, 2023, payment for supplies amounting to P50,000. *Ang* address *po* is Loboc.

Ms. Kapunan. Pangasinan *naman.* P-I-17-238, *isang* Janine Bartolin. What date was this disbursed?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang nakalagay po rito* is February 25, 2023, in the amount of ± 50,000 for payment for supplies *po. Ang* address, Pangasinan.

Ms. Kapunan. P-I-17-238, Janine Bartolin. I'm sorry. 369. P-I-17-369. Whose name is this?

Ms. Del Campo. Signature *lang po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Walang pangalan. Saan in-*issue? *Saan ibinayad itong perang ito?*

Ms. Del Campo. Compostela Valley *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. P-I-17-391, Luilito Agord, please state the date it was paid, the place, and the amount.

Ms. Del Campo. February 25, 2023 *po, p*ayment for rental of safehouse amounting to P45,000. *Ang* address *po na nakalagay* is Davao City.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. There are seven remaining acknowledgment receipts here. I'll go over them briefly. Please follow as I mention them.

P-I-17-418, only a signature appears, disbursed in Masbate for P50,000. Again, February 25, 2023.

P-I-17-430 in the name of Andrew Lacerna, issued—disbursed in Nueva Ecija for P100,000, again, dated February 25, 2023. Can you go over it?

P-I-17-431 in the name of Jamil Jaldon, disbursed in Koronadal City for P100,000, also dated February 25, 2023.

An acknowledgment receipt P-I-17-479, no name, signature only, disbursed in Batangas, for the amount of P9,000. Again, dated February 25, 2023.

Jamby Mante, received in Kalinga Apayao, P50,000 on February 25, 2023, Exhibit P-I-17-480.

P-I-17-481, Rona de Vera, received P50,000 in South Leyte, also on February 25, 2023.

And lastly, a signature received in Abra, P50,000, P-I-17-540, also on February 25, 2023. Based on these acknowledgment receipts, do you confirm?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo*.

Ms. Kapunan. That what was stated is accurate based on the records?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa mga* acknowledgment receipts *po, opo*.

Ms. Kapunan. What observation can you make or significance do you draw from these documents presented to you?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po doon sa* documents *na prinisent* (present) *sa akin, lahat po ito* is dated Feb 25, 2023 *po* with different addresses *po na nakalagay*.

Ms. Kapunan. And on the same date, disbursements on the same date with different addresses. What observation, if any, can you draw from this?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon nga po*.

Ms. Kapunan. With different addresses.

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo*.

Ms. Kapunan. Locations. Is this again, to clarify, is this a place where the money was disbursed or where the money was received?

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please. Witness is incompetent, Your Honor, to testify on that matter.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, she is competent.

The Presiding Officer. Based on the document, again, that was the earlier question of the Presiding Officer. Address *ba ito noong binigyan o* address *ito kung saan binigay*?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa* documents, as documents evidencing payment, *kung saan po binigay iyong* address.

The Presiding Officer. Okay. Kindly continue, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. *Ang ibig sabihin, kung saan binigay, ang ibig bang sabihin*, correct me if I am wrong, Madam Witness, on the same date *itong mga binigyan ng* confidential funds *ay nasa* different locations *ba,* Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po sa* documents, *opo*.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And based *sa* Joint Circular *na sinabi mo, sino dapat ang mag*-distribute or *mag*-disburse *ng perang nakalagay dito*?

Ms. Del Campo. It is the responsibility *po ng* special disbursing officer.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *tama bang sabihin*, correct me if I am wrong, *kung mali naman ang* understanding *ko, tama bang sabihin na ang* special disbursement officer *ay sa isang araw ay pinuntahan lahat itong lokasyon na ito*? *Tama ba ang* interpretation *ko*?

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please—

Ms. Kapunan. If she knows, Your Honor, she was the one who evaluated these documents.

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, that calls for a conclusion of fact.

The Presiding Officer. Witness is not competent to answer the question, Counsel. I think let the document speak for itself that if indeed the SDO is the only officer authorized to disburse the funds, then clearly it is physically impossible to be in all of these locations in one day. And there was earlier admission that the SDO gave the funds to a Colonel Lachica, probably even more. So, that remains to be seen and proven in the coming days.

Please proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Who is the special disbursement officer of the DepEd?

Ms. Del Campo. *Sa* DepEd *po* is *si* Mr. Edward Fajarda.

Ms. Kapunan. And based on your definition of a special disbursement officer, *si* Mr. Fajarda *ang* authorized *na magbigay ng lahat ng ito,* Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Going now—

The Presiding Officer. With the indulgence of Counsel, so, *sa ilalim ng* Joint Circular, *siya lang walang iba?*

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*, *ito po ay nakasama sa kaniyang* responsibility. At based on item 6.1.1 *po*, *hindi po ito puwedeng i*-transfer from one accountable to another.

Ms. Kapunan. So, based on these documents, *kasi sinabi mo si* Mr. Fajarda. So, *makikita naman natin* as observed by the Presiding Officer, these were many locations in one day.

Ngayon, Mr. Fajarda, as a special disbursement officer, *alam mo ba kung may sinabmit (submit) na dokumento si* Mr. Fajarda *na nag-i*-indicate *sa* COA *o* COA-ICFAO *na in*-authorize *niya kung sino mang ibang* individual *na mag*-distribute *nitong kaperahan na ito sa mga iba-ibang taong ito sa ibang* places *na ito*? *Mayroon bang in*-attach *na* letter or acknowledgment *si* Mr. Fajarda *o hindi* Mr. Fajarda. *Iyong* head of agency, *si* Vice President or DepEd Secretary Sara Duterte, *mayroon ba siyang sinabmit na* authorization *na binigay kay* Mr. Fajarda *na siya ang* disbursement officer *para i*-delegate *sa iba ni* Mr. Fajarda *iyong pagpunta sa iba-ibang lugar na ito sa isang araw lang? Mayroon bang dokumentong ganoon, na* authorization *ang tinanggap ng* office *mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang natanggap po namin na* authorization or designation is *si* VP Sara *ang nag*-designate *kay* Mr. Edward Fajarda as special disbursing officer *ng* Department of Education. *Naka*-attach *po ito doon sa* liquidation documents.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *may* certification *si* Vice President *kay* Mr. Fajarda. Aside from Mr. Fajarda, *mayroon bang ibang pangalan na nakalagay diyan sa dokumento*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala po. Ang nakalagay lang po doon* is *si* Mr. Fajarda *ang* designated *na* special disbursing officer *ng* DepEd *po* for confidential fund.

Ms. Kapunan. *Punta naman tayo*—last batch *na ito. Mayroon naman tayong* another list, '*no.* Attached to the Response of the Office of the Vice President *para sa* acknowledgment receipts dated March 15, 2023, liquidation *ng* Vice President—I'm sorry, *ng* DepEd. Again, please go over these acknowledgment receipts.

The Presiding Officer. This is for what quarter, Attorney Kapunan?

Ms. Kapunan. This is for the third–

The Presiding Officer. Third?

Ms. Kapunan. This is for the same quarter, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. First and second...

Ms. Kapunan. First and second quarter, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Of 2023?

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor. And we are talking about, again, from a list of 1,049 acknowledgment receipts, we have selected a few.

Madam Witness, showing to you several selected ones. I'm showing to you, being flashed on the screen, P-I-17-57, and I will go over this list very briefly if you can follow me.

Adolfo Molina; date, March 15, 2023; Buda, Marilog, Davao City for P50,000.

P-I-17-58, *walang pangalan*, signature only; date, March 15, 2023; Tandag; P30,000.

P-I-17-107, *wala na namang pangalan*, signature only; *binayad sa* Puerto Galera, Mindoro; P65,000; date, the same, March 15, 2023.

Jelyn Espino; Laguna; P50,000; date, March 15, 2023. (P-I-17-108)

Walang pangalan; P-I-17-127; signature only; date, March 15, 2023; *sa* Agusan del Norte; P40,000.

Kay Rex Napoles, *tumanggap ng* P50,000 *sa* Olongapo on the same date, March 15, 2023, P-I-17-128.

Next, Riano Recto, P-I-17-148, *sa* Zamboanga City, P40,000.

Mr. Julio Esguerra, *taga*-Butuan City, *tumanggap ng* P100,000, P-I-17-189 also on March 15, 2023.

Are you following, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. P-I-17-190, *walang pangalan*, signature only, Davao City, P25,000.

Another P50,000, *walang pangalan*, signature only, P-I-17-226, *na* issued or disbursed *in* Nabunturan.

From Nabunturan, Laguna, P50,000 *sa isang* Naizell T., P-I-17-227.

Isang walang signature *tumanggap sa* Dasmariñas, Cavite, *ng* P65,000, P-I-17-259 on March 15, 2023.

Carmen Sevillano, *taga*-Surigao del Norte, *tumanggap ng* P50,000 on the same date, March 15, 2023, P-I-17-260. *Tama*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo*.

Ms. Kapunan. Can you continue?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dito po sa—*

Ms. Kapunan. P-I-17-311—P-I-17-261, *walang pangalan, tama*, signature only, *saan naman ito* in-issue?

Ms. Del Campo. Quezon City *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Sa Quezon City for P65,000.

Ito naman P-I-17-311, *walang pangalan*, signature, Bacoor, P50,000.

Si Alice Crescencio *tumanggap galing* Iligan City, P25,000 on the same date, March 15, 2023, P-I-17-349.

P-I-17-406, *walang pangalan*, signature *lang, galing naman* Tarlac, P50,000 on the same day, March 15, 2023.

Walang pangalan, signature *lang, galing* Pasay City, *tumanggap ng* P65,000, P-I-17-422.

Isang signature *na tumanggap galing* Calbayog, Samar, P45,000, *walang pangalan*, March 15, 2023, P-I-17-423.

P-I-17-447 again, no name, Compostela Valley, *tumanggap ng* P100,000 on the same day, March 15, 2023.

Another signature received, *ni hindi mabasa ito*, San Juan City, unreadable, P30,000 on the same day, March 15, 2023, P-I-17-468.

Another signature received, *walang pangalan, sa* Aguinaldo, Ifugao, *tumanggap ng* P100,000 on March 15, 2023, P-I-17.

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

Ms. Kapunan. Three more, Your Honor, four more.

The Presiding Officer. We get the point, Counsel. We get the point, and it is in the tabulation anyway of the witness.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Now, Madam Witness, *sa mga binasa natin at sa mga na*-observe *mo, anong* significance *nitong* acknowledgment receipts *na pinakita sa iyo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ang* proof of payments *po noong* confidential fund and base *po dito*, all dated March 15, 2023, with different addresses *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. All dated?

Ms. Del Campo. March 15, 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. So, *sino dapat*, based on your Circular, *ang nag*-disburse *nitong mga pondong ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang dapat po mag*-disburse *ay ang* special disbursing officer.

Ms. Kapunan. *At sino nga ang* special disbursing officer *na iyan*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ay sa* DepEd *po*, Mr. Edward Fajarda.

Ms. Kapunan. *Kung hindi naman, kasi noong binabasa ko ito, kasi ako* Marvel Comics *ang binabasa ko*, Superman *ang* favorite *ko. Kung hindi man* Superman *ang isang* SDO, *kaya ba niyang puntahan, sa palagay mo*

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, *please.*

Ms. Kapunan. ... *lahat na ito?*

The Presiding Officer. Yes, Counsel for the Respondent?

Ms. Ferrer. The question is speculative, Your Honor.

Ms. Kapunan. What is speculative about Superman? He can fly anywhere he wants.

Ms. Ferrer. It's a hypothetical question.

The Presiding Officer. Counsel, move on. Move on, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. I will move on, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. We get your point.

Ms. Kapunan. Now, Madam Witness, what other documents—Although, can we ask that that "Superman" remain on record, Your Honor?

The Presiding Officer. We did not strike it off, Counsel. The Presiding Officer simply asked you to move on.

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, what other documents, if any? *Ano pang mga dokumento,* apart from these acknowledgment receipts for the first and second quarter constituting 1,049 documents—1,049 documents for the first quarter and second quarter. I'm sorry.

The Presiding Officer. You're in DepEd already, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. I'm sorry, 561 and 619, Your Honor, or 1,180 for the DepEd.

Anong other documents *ang in*-attach *ng* DepEd?

Ms. Del Campo. To support *po* the payment of rewards, *nag*-attach *po sila ng* certifications from relevant partners, specifically the Armed Forces of the Philippines *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. And *itong mga* certifications *ng* Armed Forces, if shown to you, would you be able to identify them?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Showing to you a Certification dated January 1, 2024 issued by Col. Manaros M. Boransing, marked as Exhibit P-I-22-a, stipulated upon by the Defense Counsel, Your Honor, Respondent;

Certification dated December 30, 2023 issued by Col. Carlos B. Sangandaan Jr., previously marked Exhibit P-I-22-b, likewise stipulated upon, common exhibit with the Defense or Respondent;

Certification dated December 5, 2023 issued by Col. Magtanggol Panopio, marked as Exhibit P-I-22-c up to P-I-22-c-1, again, stipulated by Counsel for the Respondent; and

Certification issued by Col. Adonis R. Bajao, previously marked as Exhibit P-I-22-d.

Showing to you these exhibits, Madam Witness, and as well, being flashed on the screen for easy reference of this Honorable Court, what relation do these certifications, which are both Prosecution and Defense exhibits, what do these certifications have in relation to this certification you said was issued by the Armed Forces?

Ms. Del Campo. These are the same certifications *po na naka*-attach *sa kanilang* response.

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong* significance *naman ng* certifications *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Dito po sa* certification *na ito, in*-attach *po nila ito bilang* proof of success of the information gathering and/or surveillance activities.

Ms. Kapunan. *At ito bang* proof of success *ay* compliant *sa* circular *na pinagbasehan mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. During my evaluation *po, opo, nag*—compliant *po ito doon sa* Joint Circular.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. What action, if any, *pagkatapos na*-receive *itong* certification? *Ito ba iyong sinabi ni* Attorney Wamil *na pro forma*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po. Iba po iyon.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ngayon, ano ang* actions taken by your office with regard to this certification, if any?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po*—Based *po sa* evaluation, *ito po ay* compliant *po sa* Joint Circular.

Ms. Kapunan. *At anong in*-issue *ninyo,* if any?

Ms. Del Campo. For the first and second quarter *po ng* 2023, for the DepEd, we issued *po* a Credit Notice.

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong ibig sabihin?* What do you mean by a Credit Notice?

Ms. Del Campo. A Credit Notice *po* is issued *pag—pagkatapos ng* evaluation *ng* documents, *iyong* liquidation documents *po* are found in order *po* and passed in audit *na.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Ngayon, itong* Credit Notice *na in*-issue, *ito ba ay* final?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* Credit Notice *po, puwede pong—mayroon po sa* Rules and Regulations of Settlement of Accounts *na puwede pong mai*-reopen *ang* settled account, *na gaya po noong pag nag*-issue *kami ng* Credit Notice, *puwede pa po itong ma*-reopen.

Ms. Kapunan. *Anong*—what reason would you have for reopening a Credit Notice?

Ms. Del Campo. Under the RRSA *po*, accounts settled can be reopened if before the expiration *noong* three years after the settlement is, *nagkaroon po ng—iyong* transaction is tainted with fraud, collusion, and new material evidence *po* were discovered during the three-year period *po na iyon.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. We now go, Madam Witness—*punta naman tayo sa* third quarter *ng* liquidation *ng* confidential funds *ng* DepEd. *Anong* participation *mo dito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ako po ang* tasked *na mag*-evaluate *sa* response *ng* DepEd for the third quarter of 2023.

Ms. Kapunan. And what did you do, if any?

Ms. Del Campo. Currently *po*, this is still under evaluation and review *pa po*.

Ms. Kapunan. *Sinabi mo na ikaw ang* in-charge *nang pag*-evaluate. What did you evaluate?

Ms. Del Campo. *Noong ma*-issue *po noong* August 8, 2024 *iyong* Audit Observation Memorandum, *nag*-submit *po ang* Department of Education *ng* response *noong* August 27, 2024.

Ms. Kapunan. *Nag*-mention *ka*—you mentioned an AOM, if shown to you, would you be able to identify the same?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Showing to you, Madam Witness, an AOM, please go over it. For the *Record*, this was previously marked as Exhibit P-I-21-c. It is an AOM dated August 8, 2024, stipulated upon by Defense Counsel or Counsel for the Respondent. Is this the same document that you received?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, ito po iyong* same Audit Observation Memorandum *na in*-issue *po namin sa* DepEd.

Ms. Kapunan. On the third page—please go to the third page. There appears to be a signature over the name Nilda Plaras, whose signature is this, if you know?

Ms. Del Campo. *Si* Assistant Commissioner Nilda Plaras *po, ang* officer-in-charge *ng* ICFAO *noong panahon na na*-issue *itong* AOM.

Ms. Kapunan. And you said earlier, you are familiar with her signature.

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*.

Ms. Kapunan. Now, what were the findings in this AOM?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong* AOM *po na ito is na*-issue because, first, *iyong* submitted liquidation documents lack documents evidencing payment; *pangalawa po, iyong* payment of rewards were not supported with documents evidencing success; *iyong* third *po is hindi nakalagay sa* PFP *iyong* specific confidential activities *na magiging* basis *ng* disbursement for confidential fund; *pang-apat po, iyong* disbursement voucher, *hindi nakalagay iyong* specific period or duration *ng* implementation *po ng* confidential activities; *at iyong panglima po, mayroon pong pinaggamitan iyong* confidential fund *na* purchase of information relative to car loan scams, whose victims are mostly personnel of the Department of Education.

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, this document is being flashed on the screen. Let us go to your first finding. Okay. *Ano ang dahilan kung nag—dahil nag*-issue *ka ng* finding *na iyon, iyong* first finding *na sinabi mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po—ito po, iyong* first finding, *hindi po kasi na*-submit *iyong* documents evidencing payment *po* to support the liquidation, *kaya po nakasama siya sa* AOM.

Ms. Kapunan. And what is the significance of this non-submission, if any?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po namin makikita kung sino-sino po iyong*

binayaran at recipients *noong* confidential fund. *Dito po kasi makikita iyon sa* documents evidencing payments.

Ms. Kapunan. *Iyong* second finding *mo na naka*-flash *sa* screen, *ano ang* significance *nitong* finding *mo*?

Ms. Del Campo. Based *po doon sa isinabmit* (submit) *nila na* Accomplishment Report, *mayroon pong pinaggamitan ng* payment of rewards amounting to P6,371,000 *na wala pong* attachment *ng* documents evidencing success po.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And your third findings?

Ms. Del Campo. *Hindi po nakalagay sa* Physical and Financial Plan *iyong* specific confidential activities *na paggagamitan ng* confidential fund.

Ms. Kapunan. Why is this significant?

Ms. Del Campo. *Para po ma*-check *kung paano nila gagamitin—dito po kasi sa* Physical and

Financial Plan, *dito nakikita kung paano nila gagamitin iyong* confidential fund *nila. Dito po sa isinabmit* (submit) *nila, hindi naka*-specify *kung anong* confidential activities *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Iyong* fourth, *iyong* fourth finding *ninyo. Ano itong* significance *kung bakit nakalagay diyan sa* AOM?

Ms. Del Campo. Under Item 6.1.5 *po ng* Joint Circular, *dapat nakalagay sa* disbursement voucher *iyong* duration *ng* implementation *ng* cash—ng project. *Pero iyong naka*-attach *po na* disbursement voucher, *hindi po nakalagay iyong* period.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. And your last finding, what is the reason *bakit nakalagay iyan sa* AOM?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon pong* Accomplishment Report *nila, mayroon po silang ibinayad* for purchase of information for *doon nga po* relative to car loan scams *na hindi kasama doon sa* enumeration, *at hindi* intended to support the mandate of the operation of the Department of Education. *Kaya po nakasama po siya sa* AOM.

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, after this AOM was issued and you have furnished the DepEd, correct?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Ano ang ginawa ng* DepEd, if any?

Ms. Del Campo. *Noong na*-receive *po nila ito, nag*-submit *po sila ng* response *noong* August 27, 2024.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, please, this response being referred to by the witness is a stipulated document, it is Exhibit P-I-21-D, now being shown to the witness.

Madam Witness, is this the same response?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo, ito po iyong* same response *na isinabmit sa amin ng* DepEd *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And, Madam Witness, what documents, if you recall, were attached to this response of the DepEd?

Ms. Del Campo. *Nag*-submit *po sila ng mga* acknowledgment receipts as documents evidencing payments; *nag*-submit *din po sila ng* mga certification from the Armed Forces of the Philippines to support the payment of rewards *po*; and *nag*-submit *din po sila ng* accomplished na disbursement voucher, *na nakalagay po doon iyong* period covered by the cash advance.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. You mentioned several acknowledgment receipts, and we have selected a few acknowledgment receipts.

Your Honor, please, the import of these acknowledgment receipts are the same as the first and second set—they indicate, Your Honor, and by way of manifestation, they indicate that all of these acknowledgment receipts were issued and the amounts disbursed on one date, August 9, 2023, to different people in different locations.

The Presiding Officer. Does the witness have a tabulation and/or summary?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*, Your Honor.

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor, we have a tabulation and summary.

The Presiding Officer. Previously marked, not yet, Counsel?

Ms. Kapunan. It has not been marked, Your Honor, and we request that this, after identification by the witness, be marked as Exhibit P-I-35. Tabulation being shown or being furnished Counsel for the Respondent and this Honorable Court.

The Presiding Officer. Kindly furnish Counsel for Respondent as well as the Presiding Officer with a copy of your tabulation.

Miss Xylene, *kayo po ang gumawa ng* tabulation *na ito*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

The Presiding Officer. *Tulad ng paghahanda at* tabulation *na ginawa ninyong—nauna ninyong ginawa para sa ibang* quarters *ng* OVP *at ng* DepEd?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po,* Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. You may proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, please, this tabulation—Okay. On its face, this tabulation will show the acknowledgment receipts. And, as earlier indicated, we will dispense with going over selected acknowledgment receipts, the purpose of which, principally, is to show that one single disbursement officer, Mr. Fajarda, issued on August 9, 2023, to several locations from Luzon, Visayas, Mindanao, on one date, Your Honor, and I can ask the witness to confirm this based on the documents.

The Presiding Officer. Not all, Counsel, but several.

Ms. Kapunan. Several selected documents.

The Presiding Officer. Several, yes.

Ms. Kapunan. I can name the markings: P-I-17-1246, P-I (dash—all P-I-17 sub-marked 1246; 1247; 1281; 1320; 1321; 1361; 1398; 1399; 1435; 1486; 1587; 1626; 1627; 1628; 1745; 1820; 1871; and 1872, all indicating several recipients, several locations, one date, and I will ask the witness—who is the disbursing officer for this third quarter of the DepEd?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* SDO *po ng* DepEd *ay si* Mr. Edward Fajarda.

Ms. Kapunan. And by virtue of his function, it is Mr. Fajarda who, presumably, Madam Witness, disbursed these amounts?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Any authorization from the DepEd Secretary, Vice President Sara Duterte, indicating or designating another person outside Mr. Fajarda to disburse these various amounts in various places on this date, Madam Witness? Any document attached to the submission?

Ms. Del Campo. *Wala po, iyong* designation *lang po ni* Mr. Fajarda.

Ms. Kapunan. Among these—just for the *Record*, Your Honor, among these submissions is the name of Joel Chua. He—

The Presiding Officer. That is not Chua, Counsel, that is Chiu.

Ms. Kapunan. Yes, Your Honor.

Upon verification by this representation, he denies any family connection, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Proceed, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. The signature—Madam Witness, will you go through this document?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. The signature is in Chinese character. Can we ask the fellow Prosecutor to identify his signature?

The Presiding Officer. That would be self-serving, Counsel. Move on, Counsel. Move on.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Madam Witness, outside these acknowledgment receipts you said that there was no separate document indicating any authorized officer to disburse these amounts in different places on said date. Madam Witness, do you confirm that?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. Outside acknowledgment receipts, what other document was submitted by way of liquidation?

Ms. Del Campo. To support *po* the payment of rewards, they submitted certifications from the Armed Forces of the Philippines.

Ms. Kapunan. And if these certifications are shown to you, Madam Witness, would you be able to identify the same?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Showing to you, Madam Witness, and being flashed on the screen with the kind indulgence of the Honorable Presiding Officer, there is a certification dated September 25, 2023, issued by Jaicris Jan Mendoza, Prosecution Exhibit P-I-22-E, stipulated as well by the Defense; certification dated December 10, 2023, P-I-22-f, also issued by Jaicris Jan F. Mendoza; Exhibit P-I-22-g is a certification, dated December 12, 2023, issued by an Adonis R. Bajao. Likewise, a Defense' exhibit, Your Honor; Certification dated July 1, 2024, issued by a certain Darren E. Comia, Prosecution's Exhibit P-I-22-h. All certifications, Your Honor, for—are likewise Defense's documents.

The Presiding Officer. Do you confirm, Madam Witness, that these were part of the submissions of the DepEd?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*, *kasama po iyon sa* response *nila sa* AOM for the third quarter *po*.

The Presiding Officer. Okay.

Ms. Kapunan. What relation do these certifications have to the one you mentioned? Are they the same?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po*, *pareho pong* certification.

Ms. Kapunan. And what observations have you made as regards these certifications?

Ms. Del Campo. Currently *po*, the review and evaluation *po noong* compliance *na ito ng* Department of Education *po* is under review *pa po at* evaluation.

Ms. Kapunan. In connection with the earlier certifications which I asked you, you mentioned certain credit notice. And you said that these credit notices, which you issued, is not final, correct?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Now tell us what would be the grounds for opening a credit notice, if you know?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ang* account *po na* settled can be reopened *kasi po* if the transaction is tainted with fraud, collusion, or new material evidence were discovered before *mag*-expire *iyong* three-year period *po ng* settlement *noong* account.

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. So, you're saying that even if because of the certifications submitted as to these activities a credit notice was issued in the three-year period, your office, COA-ICFAO can reopen on the grounds of—what are these grounds again?

Ms. Del Campo. If the transaction is tainted with fraud, collusion or—

Ms. Kapunan. What do you mean by fraud in the transactions?

Ms. Del Campo. *May anomalya po sa paggamit po noong pondo.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay. *Ano pa*?

Ms. Del Campo. And new material evidence were discovered *po* before the expiration of the three-year period.

Ms. Kapunan. The second ground. And the third ground is?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyon po*, *may na*-discover *po na* material evidence *po* before the expiration of the three-year period.

Ms. Kapunan. Now, Madam Witness, what is the current status of the evaluation of the response? You said earlier *na dahil sa* action taken by the COA-ICFAO *nag*-respond *ang* DepEd. What is the status of that response...

Ms. Del Campo. *Ine*-evaluate *pa po*—

Ms. Kapunan. ...for the third quarter September 30—July 12 to September 30, 2023, if you know?

Ms. Del Campo. This is until—no—under evaluation and review *pa po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Under evaluation?

Ms. Del Campo. *Opo.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Bakit hanggang ngayon* eh under evaluation?

Ms. Del Campo. *Ito po ay* under evaluation *pa din hanggang ngayon kasi po* this transaction composed of voluminous documents *na kailangang pag-aralan.* And *sa* review process *po namin, pagkatapos ko po itong ma*-evaluate, *iaakyat ko po ito sa aking* Division Chief *na* extensive *din po ang kaniyang pagdadaanang* review. And after *po sa* Division Chief, *aakyat pa po ito sa* Officer-in-Charge *ng* ICFAO for further review *po.*

And *sa* ICFAO *po kasi, kulang po kami sa* manpower and *marami po kaming nare*-receive *na iba-ibang* documents from different agencies *po na mayroon ding ganito karaming mga* documentations *po.* And *itong mga* agencies *pong ito,* fair *po ang aming pag*-treat *sa kanila kaya po binibigyan namin ng pansin lahat po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Okay, now, Madam Witness, in his testimony when asked, Mr. Wamil said that based on his evaluation, during the period that he was there with the COA-ICFAO, he made a finding that these documents submitted by the OVP and the DepEd, for that particular period he was in the COA-ICFAO, were irregular based on the guidelines or based on the joint circular that you cited.

Ms. Del Campo. Yes.

Ms. Kapunan. To you, Madam Witness, you who took over these same documents that were submitted and who made your own independent evaluation, what would you say? Are these documents—what can you say about these documents submitted by the OVP and the DepEd based on your post-audit evaluation?

Ms. Del Campo. *Iyong sa* OVP *po, ito ay* irregular *po dahil hindi ito naging* compliant *sa* joint circular. During the time *naman po na in*-evaluate *ko ang* Department of Education, compliant *po sila sa* joint circular, *pero gaya nga po ng nasabi, puwede pong ma*-reopen *itong* settled account *ng* Department of Education *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *Mayroong sinayt* (cite) *si Attorney Wamil na prima facie* evidence, *ano.* You are not a lawyer but under accounting rules, *tama ba iyong* interpretation *na 'pag hindi kumpleto,* if the documents submitted based on 8.3 of the joint circular—if the documents submitted by way of liquidation of confidential funds are not complete, *ano ang epekto nito* based on the circular?

Ms. Del Campo. Under *po sa* joint circular *doon sa* under 8.1 *nga po,* failure of the accountable officer to liquidate is a *prima facie* evidence *na nagamit po ito* for personal use and benefit.

Ms. Kapunan. Now, you said that *prima facie*—failure of the accountable officer. *At* earlier *tinanong ka, ang* accountable officer *ng* OVP is the head of agency, meaning, *sino iyon*?

Ms. Del Campo. *Si Vice President Sara Duterte po.*

Ms. Kapunan. *At sa* DepEd *naman, sino ang* head of agency?

Ms. Del Campo. During the time *po noong* 2023, it is Vice President Sara Duterte *din po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And under 8.3, *ang* presumption is *naging* used, to quote, *paki*-quote, "used for personal ...?"

Ms. Del Campo. *Sabi po sa* 8.3, "failure of the accountable officer to liquidate is a *prima facie* evidence that he or she used the missing funds for personal use and benefit."

Ms. Kapunan. Madam Witness, my last question to you, Madam Witness, let us go back to this hearing in the Committee on Good Government Accountability and there is an admission there, Madam Witness, in your testimony here, that you in that hearing, Gina Acosta, Chief of Staff of the VP, admitted—of the SDO, I am sorry—admitted to transferring confidential funds, *tama,* to Colonel Lachica?

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, Counsel for the Respondent.

Ms. Kapunan. There is no question yet, Your Honor.

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, the exact wordings of the Counsel cannot be verified without reflecting the TSNs that she is referring to.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, I am referring to the testimony of this witness. Besides, in the previous hearing, there is judicial notice already of the TSNs.

The Presiding Officer. No, that is not it, Counsel. Witness already admitted in her earlier testimony that she was there when Gina Acosta testified before the House of Representatives and heard her testify. Based on her recollection of what she said, she may answer. Kindly finish your last question, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. I forgot. You repeat my question. What did I say? *Wala pa akong* question. Okay, based on this admission of Gina Acosta that indeed confidential funds were transferred, the disbursement of confidential funds were transferred to Colonel Lachica. What about in relation to the DepEd funds?

Ms. Del Campo. *May nabanggit din po noon si Mr. Fajarda na ibinibigay niya iyong* confidential fund *kay Colonel Nolasco po.*

Ms. Kapunan. Again?

Ms. Del Campo. *May naging* admission under oath—

Ms. Kapunan. May admission din under oath. In the same hearing, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po.*

Ms. Kapunan. What was that admission?

Ms. Del Campo. *Sinabi din po ni Mr. Edward Fajarda na SDO ng DepEd na binibigay po niya iyong* cash advance for confidential fund *kay Colonel Nolasco.*

Ms. Kapunan. And who is this Fajarda?

Ms. Del Campo. *Siya po ang* Special Disbursing Officer *ng* Department of Education.

Ms. Kapunan. And who is Nolasco?

Ms. Del Campo. *Isa po siya sa mga*—part *po siya ng* Vice Presidential and Security Protection Group.

Ms. Kapunan. So, our understanding is, in the Office of the Vice President, an admission of Gina Acosta that disbursement was given to some other person. The same admission was made by the DepEd SDO Fajarda that disbursement of the funds was given to somebody else, Madam Witness?

Ms. Del Campo. Yes *po, tama po.*

Ms. Kapunan. And what observation—As a COA-ICFAO State Auditor, what significance or observation can you make from these admissions by both Gina Acosta and Fajarda?

Ms. Del Campo. This is a violation *po* of the joint circular, specifically *iyong* Item 6.1.1, *na hindi dapat ito i-*transfer from one accountable officer to another.

Ms. Kapunan. No further questions, Your Honor.

The Presiding Officer. Thank you, Counsel.

It is 2:28. I promised the Senate President we will finish by 2:30, so that we can convene session at 3:00 p.m.

Counsel for the Respondent, Attorney Kristine, can you do your cross tomorrow instead of today?

Ms. Ferrer. I can, Your Honor.

Ms. Kapunan. Your Honor, before I turn over to our head, Your Honor, may I make just this manifestation for the record, just to clear.

The Presiding Officer. Yes, Counsel.

Ms. Kapunan. For avoidance, Your Honor, although we did mark the tabulations and summaries, Your Honor, for avoidance of doubt and for the record, the authenticity of the ARs are deemed established when the parties agreed and agreed with the dispensing of identification, Your Honor.

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please.

The Presiding Officer. So noted.

Ms. Ferrer. Your Honor, please. Just a counter-manifestation to her statement.

The Presiding Officer. You may do so, Counsel, before we adjourn.

Ms. Ferrer. There was no such admission, Your Honor, and there was no dispensing of identification of the ARs. Precisely, that is what the witness did today, Your Honor. Thank you.

The Presiding Officer. It is without prejudice to Counsel for the Respondent crossing the witness using their copies of the AR, which reminds the Presiding Officer to also remind the Counsel for the Respondent to kindly submit copies of their pre-marked documents, specifically the ARs covering the last quarter of 2022 and the first three quarters of 2023 for both the OVP and the DepEd insofar as the first three quarters of 2023 is concerned. If not within today, by tomorrow, Counsel. Attorney Kristine?

Ms. Ferrer. Yes, Your Honor. We'll do that.

The Presiding Officer. Thank you very much. What is the pleasure of Senator-Judge Zubiri?

MANIFESTATION OF SENATOR-JUDGE ZUBIRI

Observing that the previous week's legislative sessions had generally lasted only two to three hours, Senator-Judge Zubiri proposed holding regular legislative sessions at 10:00 a.m., and commencing the impeachment trial at 3:00 p.m. He explained that the revised schedule would ensure the uninterrupted presentation of evidence and cross-examination of witnesses, while allow the public to follow the proceedings without interruption.

He further suggested that the impeachment trial be allowed to continue until 10:00 p.m. or as necessary, to facilitate the expeditious disposition of the proceedings.

The Presiding Officer stated that the schedules could be adjusted as necessary, provided that the parties were given at least one day's notice of any change.

Senator-Judge Cayetano (P) recalled that the existing schedule had previously been discussed in caucus and suggested that it be taken up again, particularly in view of the absence of the Minority Floor Leader. The Presiding Officer stated that no change in schedule would be made during the week.

Senator-Judge Zubiri agreed to await the attendance of the Minority Leader and to further consider the proposal in caucus, with the view to reaching a decision the following day. Senator-Judge Villar (C) likewise suggested that the matter be discussed in caucus, recalling that a previous proposal to move the legislative session from 10:00 to 10:30 a.m. had also been referred to a discussion in caucus.

The Presiding Officer stated that there was no urgency to resolve the matter.

Senator-Judge Zubiri clarified that he merely intended to place the proposed schedule on record and give the parties sufficient notice should it take effect the following Monday.

MANIFESTATION OF REPRESENTATIVE CHUA

Representative Chua stated that it was the Panel for Prosecutors' understanding that its witness list for the following week was due that day. He however noted that witnesses Marivic Pareja, Gina Acosta, and Edward Fajarda—had already been subpoenaed to appear at the next day's hearing. He thus requested to submit the names of their witnesses after the following day's, depending on its outcome.

The Presiding Officer granted the request, noting that the mentioned witnesses had already been subpoenaed to appear at the following day's hearing. He stated that, should any of the witnesses not be presented during the hearing, new subpoenas would be issued for their appearance, together with subpoenas for any additional witnesses to be presented the following week.

ADJOURNMENT OF THE IMPEACHMENT TRIAL

The Presiding Officer declared the impeachment trial adjourned until 10:00 a.m. on Wednesday, August 12, 2026.

It was 2:35 p.m.

I hereby certify to the correctness of the foregoing.

Atty. RENATO N. BANTUG JR.
Clerk of Court

Approved on August 12, 2026